# POLITECNICO DI TORINO Repository ISTITUZIONALE

# Safety and Technical Feasibility of Sustainable Reuse of Shale Gas Flowback and Produced Water after Advanced Treatment Aimed at Wheat Irrigation

Original

Safety and Technical Feasibility of Sustainable Reuse of Shale Gas Flowback and Produced Water after Advanced Treatment Aimed at Wheat Irrigation / Yang, Yushun; Tian, Lun; Borch, Thomas; Tariq, Huma; Li, Tong; Bai, Yuhua; Su, Yihong; Tiraferri, Alberto; Crittenden, John C.; Liu, Baicang. - In: ACS SUSTAINABLE CHEMISTRY & ENGINEERING. - ISSN 2168-0485. - 10:38(2022), pp. 12540-12551. [10.1021/acssuschemeng.2c02170]

Availability: This version is available at: 11583/2971752 since: 2022-09-26T16:11:52Z

Publisher: ACS

Published DOI:10.1021/acssuschemeng.2c02170

Terms of use:

This article is made available under terms and conditions as specified in the corresponding bibliographic description in the repository

Publisher copyright

(Article begins on next page)

# Grains Metal Toxicity and Transcriptomic Analysis of Wheat Irrigated with Treated Shale Gas Flowback and Produced Water

5 Yushun Yang, <sup> $\dagger$ ,  $\ddagger$ </sup> Lun Tian, <sup> $\dagger$ ,  $\ddagger$ </sup> Thomas Borch,<sup>§</sup> Chen Chen,<sup>¶</sup> Yuhua Bai, <sup>⊥</sup> Yihong Su, <sup>#</sup>

6 Alberto Tiraferri,  $\nabla$  John C. Crittenden, <sup>o</sup> Baicang Liu, <sup>†,‡, \*</sup>

7 <sup>†</sup>Key Laboratory of Deep Earth Science and Engineering (Ministry of Education), State Key

8 Lab. Hydraul. & Mt. River Engn, College of Architecture and Environment, Sichuan

9 University, Chengdu, Sichuan 610065, PR China

- 10 <sup>‡</sup>Yibin Institute of Industrial Technology, Sichuan University Yibin Park, Yibin, Sichuan
- 11 644000, PR China
- 12 <sup>§</sup>Department of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Colorado State University, 1320
- 13 Campus Delivery, Fort Collins, CO 80523, USA
- 14 "Litree Purifying Technology Co., Ltd, Haikou, Hainan 571126, PR China
- 15 <sup>1</sup>Infrastructure Construction Department, Chengdu University, Chengdu, Sichuan 610106, PR
- 16 China
- <sup>17</sup> <sup>#</sup>Sinopec Petroleum Engineering Jianghan Co., Ltd., Wuhan, Hubei 430073, PR China

<sup>\*</sup>Corresponding author. Tel.: +86-28-85995998; fax: +86-28-62138325; E-mail: bcliu@scu.edu.cn; baicangliu@gmail.com (B. Liu).

- 18 <sup>V</sup>Department of Environment, Land and Infrastructure Engineering, Politecnico di Torino,
- 19 Corso Duca degli Abruzzi 24, 10129 Turin, Italy
- 20 <sup>o</sup>Brook Byers Institute for Sustainable Systems, School of Civil and Environmental
- 21 Engineering, Georgia Institute of Technology, Atlanta, GA 30332, USA

## 23 ABSTRACT:

24 Flowback and produced water (FPW) from shale gas extraction is proposed to be rationally 25 reused for agricultural irrigation. The effects of FPW on the germination period, macroscopic 26 growth, element enrichment, and grain gene expression of wheat were investigated upon 27 dilution and advanced membrane treatment of the liquid stream. Compared to tap water, 28 irrigation with treated FPW shortened the germination time, slightly improved the seed vigor 29 index, and ensured germination rate. On the other hand, the biomass and grain yield of 30 mature wheat irrigated with treated FPW and with FPW diluted to 5% groups decreased 31 compared to tests deploying tap water. After a whole growth cycle of wheat cultivated with 32 three kinds of irrigation water, the enrichment content of several heavy metals in soil was 33 within the prescribed risk control value. Higher concentrations of nutrients, such as K, Ca, 34 and Mg were enriched in mature wheat tissue irrigated with treated FPW. A total of 1973 35 differentially expression genes were mainly related to binding, catalytic activity, cellular 36 process, metabolic process, and cell part, more than half of which were up-regulated. These 37 findings provide critical guidance for agricultural application of shale gas wastewater reuse 38 from the perspective of plant uptake, environmental safety, and health risks.

39 Keywords: shale gas wastewater, agricultural irrigation, wheat, heavy metal, transcriptomic
40 analysis

41 Synopsis: Treated shale gas flowback and produced water is deployed to irrigate wheat,
42 providing critical guidance for rational and safe reuse of this stream.

#### 44 **INTRODUCTION**

45 Rapid increase in global production of shale gas, an emerging resource of unconventional fossil fuels, comes with risks of local environmental pollution and health-related concerns.<sup>1-4</sup> 46 47 The expansion of energy production from shale or unconventional plays results in massive 48 consumption of freshwater for hydraulic fractures and in the co-production and potentially 49 improper disposal of large volumes of high-salinity flowback and produced water (FPW). 50 This trend has brought about environmental and economic challenges, exacerbated by water 51 competition between different water-intensive sectors, and has caused health problems especially in densely populated areas and where water resources are scarce.<sup>5-9</sup> Management 52 53 options for shale gas wastewater typically include injection of FPW into subsurface 54 formations, which may however stimulate tight shale formations inducing earthquakes, and 55 beneficial reuse strategies, such as for dust suppression, industrial power generation, and irrigation.<sup>10-12</sup> 56

57 FPW is composed by the natural formation water extracted from underground oil & gas 58 resources, so-called produced water, and by the injection fluid utilized during the hydraulic 59 fracturing process, so-called flowback water. Therefore, FPW usually contains high 60 concentrations of total dissolved solids (TDS), organic matter (dissolved organic carbon; 61 DOC), metals, hydrocarbons and other volatile compounds, some synthetic organic chemical 62 additives, as well as some naturally occurring radioactive materials that may be present in the formation.<sup>13-16</sup> In recent years, the option of applying FPW directly or indirectly for 63 agricultural irrigation has become a focus of growing discussion.<sup>17-19</sup> Small amounts of 64 65 organic matter and micronutrient elements in municipal sewage and industrial wastewaters, at

66 times also including rare earth elements, have been shown to promote the growth of some 67 algae strains or higher plants under certain circumstances. On the other hand, the salinity, 68 alkalinity, and ionic composition of oilfield produced water may significantly hinder its reuse 69 in agriculture, since these characteristics can cause nutrient imbalances, as well as osmotic and specific ion stress in plant cells. 23-2520, 21 Methods of reusing produced water with 70 71 minimal TDS treatment or upon dilution for farmland irrigation were applied in Kern County 72 (California) a few years ago, but the complexity of FPW composition has gradually aroused public concern.<sup>22</sup> 73

74 The available literature suggests that the concentration of TDS and DOC of irrigation 75 water should be lower than 3500 mg/L and 5 mg/L, respectively, to maintain normal plant 76 growth and biomass accumulation, and that the use of water with substance conents above the current guidelines to irrigate crops may lead to yield reduction and germination problems.<sup>26</sup>, 77 <sup>27</sup> Previous studies on the irrigation-oriented reuse of oil & gas wastewater without treatment 78 79 or upon simple dilution have shown that this approach has potential significant side effects on 80 plant growth, yield, gene expression, and soil ecology. Applying different percentages of PW 81 to irrigate wheat has been observed to lead to a decline in yield and a negative effect on 82 physiological parameters, even when the wastewater was diluted by as much as 90% with tap water, also inducing an adverse impact on soil health and microbial diversity.<sup>17, 20, 27</sup> In 83 84 addition, irrigating wheat with diluted PW can inhibit the expression of some disease-resistant genes in the crop.<sup>28</sup> Other studies reported that simulated produced water 85 86 used to irrigate non-food biofuel crops resulted in significantly lower growth and worse physiological characteristics of the crops due to high PW salinity and excess organic 87

88 carbon.<sup>21</sup>

This study investigates the effects on the physiological and biochemical characteristics of wheat of the use of effluents from a shale gas wastewater treatment plant for irrigation. Also, differences in wheat grain gene expression as well as accumulation levels of various nutrient and toxic elements are evaluated. This study aims at providing a better understanding of the potential side-effects of FPW reuse for irrigation purposes to support improvements in this reuse strategy and promote water saving strategies.

95 MATERIALS AND METHODS

96 Preparation of water, soil, and seeds. The untreated shale gas flowback and produced 97 water was obtained from a shale gas mining station in the Sichuan Basin. The treated stream 98 was instead collected from China's first shale gas wastewater treatment plant located in 99 Fuling, Chongqing. As shown in Figure S1, the treatment plant consists of a multi-stage 100 pretreatment coupled with two-stage reverse osmosis filtration, for a daily processing 101 capacity of 2400 m<sup>3</sup>. The treated effluent meets the first level standard of the Integrated Wastewater Discharge Standard (GB8978-1996).<sup>29</sup> The soil was excavated from the campus 102 103 land of Sichuan University (Chengdu, China), then thoroughly mixed and crushed into 104 smaller particles before the experiments. Wheat was selected as the crop of interest for this study.<sup>30</sup> The spring wheat (Triticum aestivum, Jinchun 6) seeds were purchased from Fu Yi 105 106 Chun Seed Co., Ltd (HeJian, China), and stored in the dark and under dry conditions until 107 use.

108 Germination test of wheat seeds. Wheat seeds were cultivated with three different kinds
109 of irrigation water sources: a tap water (TW) control, treated flowback and produced water

110 (TFPW), and diluted untreated flowback and produced water (FPW5, equivalent to 95% FPW 111 + 5% TW). Each culture group contained 30 wheat seeds, individually weighing 0.045 $\pm$ 0.005 112 g, and was equally divided and transferred to five sterile petri dishes comprising a qualitative filter paper and 15 mL of corresponding water, which were both replaced every 24 h. All petri 113 dishes were exposed to natural light at room temperature  $(\sim 20 \text{ °C})^{31}$  for six days, and the 114 115 number of wheat roots and sprouts were recorded daily to compare the germination rates 116 between the control and the experimental groups. Seedlings height and root length were 117 measured with a millimeter ruler. Seed vigor index (SVI) was calculated as described previously.<sup>32</sup> 118

119 Greenhouse trial and harvesting. After the 6-day incubation in petri dishes described 120 above, six wheat seedlings were picked for ech group, and the transplanted into an open 121 plastic container, two-thirds of which were filled with the soil. The transplantation depth of 122 all seedlings was about  $3 \sim 4$  cm, and the above-ground height was between 4 and 5 cm. All 123 seedlings were cultured for 65 days and irrigated with the corresponding water every two 124 days. Each container consumed approximately 300 mL of corresponding water at a time. The 125 wheat growth of each treatment group was recorded every six days. Upon harvesting, all 126 wheat seedlings were rinsed with tap water, washed with ultrapure water (ULUPURE, 127 Chengdu, China) three times, then dried with an electric thermostatic drying oven 128 (DHG-9070A, Shanghai) at 60 °C until constant weight was achieved. The above-ground 129 biomass, under-ground biomass, and grain yield of each plant were thus determined.

Analysis fo the irrigation water quality. The TDS and conductivity were determined by
an Ultrameter II 6PFC portable multifunctional meter (Myron L Company, Carlsbad, CA,

132 USA). The turbidity and UV absorbance were measured by a turbidimeter (2100Q, Hach 133 Company, Loveland, CO, U.S.A.) and a UV-Vis spectrophotometry (Orion AquaMate 8000, 134 Thermo Fisher Scientific, Inc., MA, USA), respectively. Samples were filtered through 0.45 135 µm polyethersulfone membrane filters and analyzed for TOC and TN by a TOC analyzer 136 (TOC-L CPH, Shimadzu, Kyoto, Japan). In addition, quantitative analyses of ions and 137 elements were performed with ion chromatography (Dionex ICS-1100, Thermo Fisher 138 Scientific, Inc., MA, USA) and an inductively coupled plasma mass spectrometer (ICP-MS, 139 NexION 1000G PerkinElmer, Inc., MA, USA).

140 Soil and wheat tissues digestion and quantitative analysis. Samples of broken soil (not 141 used to cultivate plants) and rhizosphere soil (extracted from the vicinity of mature wheat 142 roots in each treatment group) were collected and classified as raw soil, TFPW soil, TW soil, 143 and FPW5 soil. These samples were mashed, then passed through a 100-mesh nylon sieve, 144 and finally placed in the electric thermostatic drying oven until constant weight was reached. 145 A total of 100 mg dry soil samples were thus placed in a polytetrafluoroethylene (PTFE) tube, 146 mixed with 6 mL of nitric acid and 1 mL of hydrogen peroxide, and digested with a 147 microwave dissolver (MDS-6G, SINEO, Shanghai, China). Then, samples of the resulting 148 solutions were diluted to a volume of 50 mL using ultrapure water. Similarly, mature wheat 149 tissues (root, stem, leaf, and grain) intended for quantitative analysis of macro and trace 150 elements were also washed, dried, digested, and diluted. After digestion and dilution, all 151 samples were filtered using a 0.22 µm PTFE filter and quantitatively assayed for elemental 152 composition. For homogeneity and expedient comparison, the elements content in soil and 153 plant tissue samples is presented as mass ratio (mg/kg).

154 Transcriptome sequencing of wheat grains. Before wheat matured completely, less than 155 0.1 g of fresh grains in each group was taken out, washed with DEPC water (RNase-free), 156 frozen directly in liquid nitrogen for 30 min, and stored at -80 °C for RNA extraction. The 157 total RNA was extracted from wheat grains using TRIzol® Reagent. Afterward, the 158 transcriptome sequencing process was executed with the Illumina NovaSeq 6000 sequencer 159 (Majorbio Bio-pharm Technology Co., Ltd, Shanghai, China). Details including RNA 160 extraction, sequencing, read mapping, DEGs (differentially expressed genes), and functional 161 enrichment are summarized in Text S1 (SI). Raw sequencing data were stored in NCBI 162 database under bioproject number PRJNA813217, with biosample numbers SAMN26455859, 163 SAMN26455866, and SAMN26455867.

164 **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION** 

165 Characterization of irrigation water. The detailed water quality indicators of the three 166 irrigation water sources are summarized in **Table 1**. The TFPW was within the limits set by 167 China and by FAO standards with respect to maximum salinity and elements toxicity, while 168 the other two waters did not fully respect the limits. In particular, strontium (Sr) in TW 169 exceeded the limit (0.295 mg/L), being slightly higher than the concentration of 0.2 mg/L 170 recommended by FAO guidelines. With respect to FPW5, several parameters, including TDS 171 and As, were orders of magnitude higher compared to those in TFPW and TW. The relatively 172 low concentration of heavy metals in TFPW might minimize accumulation of these elements 173 in plants and soil. However, the contents of DOC, TN, Ag, and Sn in TFPW were the highest 174 among the three types of irrigation water. The presence of these substances and that of 175 specific organic compounds, such as benzenes and polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs), 176 may lead to detrimental effects on the crops, which requires further research.<sup>33, 34</sup>

177 Effects on seeds germination and phenotypic analysis. Results on the physiological 178 conditions of wheat in different treatment groups during germination stages are summarized 179 in **Figure 1**, including germination number, seedling height, root length, and seed vigor index. 180 After 6-day germination culture, the germination number of wheat seeds exposed to TFPW 181 was comparable to that of the TW control group, whereas the germination number was lower 182 for FPW5 irrigation (Figure 1A). In detail, the germination rates of TFPW and TW groups 183 exceeded 85%, while the FPW5 was only 70%. Therefore, irrigation with TFPW slightly 184 shortened the germination period. Application of TFPW practically maintained the same 185 seedling height and seed vigor observed for TW. On the contrary, application of FPW5 186 remarkably decreased (p < 0.05) both seedling height and seed vigor index by roughly 20 and 187 45% (Figures 1B and 1D). Figure 1C presents the results obtained for the root length related 188 to root numbers in the seed germination test. Even within the same irrigation group, the 189 number and length of taproots were diverse. When considering samples with the same 190 number of roots, the relationship between the average root length of the three groups was: 191 TFPW>TW>FPW5. In summary, the use of treated shale gas wastewater was suitable in the 192 germination stage of wheat seeds, consistent with previously reported leafy vegetables cultivation.<sup>31, 35</sup> 193

194

195 **Table 1.** Water quality of three irrigation waters (TFPW, TW, FPW5); national and

196 international guidelines for irrigation.

|--|

				37	
Turbidity	0.20	0.23	0.67	/	/
Conductivity	49	336	3224	/	3000
(µs/cm)					
DOC (mg/L)	2.90	0.85	1.18	/	/
TN (mg/L)	5.136	0.854	3.456	/	/
UV <sub>254</sub> (cm <sup>-1</sup> )	0.006	0.010	0.013	/	/
TDS (mg/L)	22	160	1660	1000	2000
Na (mg/L)	6.220	4.920	534.785	/	920
Ca (mg/L)	0.464	50.293	105.204	/	400
Mg (mg/L)	0.029	11.486	17.301	/	60
K (mg/L)	0.310	3.090	12.630	/	2
Ba (mg/L)	0.091	0.252	4.573	/	/
Sr (mg/L)	0.097	0.295	7.687	/	0.2
Fe (µg/L)	21.91	494.86	756.93	/	5000
Mn (µg/L)	0.053	0.704	37.705	300	200
Cu (µg/L)	0.609	0.663	9.493	500	200
Zn (µg/L)	57.55	404.15	393.70	2000	2000
Mo (μg/L)	0.5	1.3	1.7	500	10
Ni (µg/L)	0.088	4.750	6.100	100	200
Cr (µg/L)	10.45	11.05	11.15	100	100
Se (µg/L)	0.15	0.52	5.26	20	20
As (µg/L)	0.009	0.396	2.705	50	100
Pb (µg/L)	0.010	0.15	0.200	200	5000
Cd (µg/L)	NA	NA	0.005	10	10
Ag (µg/L)	0.008	0.004	0.005	/	/
Al (μg/L)	7.165	101.494	109.04	/	5000
Co (µg/L)	NA	0.061	0.089	1000	50
Sb (µg/L)	0.40	0.50	2.75	/	/
Sn (µg/L)	0.125	0.039	0.085	/	/
V (µg/L)	0.040	0.408	16.078	100	100
F⁻ (mg/L)	0.039	0.172	0.444	2	1
Cl⁻ (mg/L)	8.501	30.871	870.265	350	350
Br⁻ (mg/L)	0.105	3.480	5.670	/	/
NO₃ <sup>-</sup> (mg/L)	0.145	5.330	7.160	/	10
SO4 <sup>2-</sup> (mg/L)	0.584	44.803	48.209	/	960

197 Note: NA, not available.



Figure 1. Germination performance of wheat seeds in different irrigation groups: treated flowback and produced water (TFPW, red), tap water control (TW, blue), diluted FPW (FPW5, green). (A) Germination number; (B) seedlings height on the sixth day; (C) root length for samepls in which the number of seedling roots were 3, 4, and 5; (D) seed vigor index.

205

Effects on wheat growth and harvesting. After being transplanted, the wheat seedlings were cultivated for 65 days and then harvested (Figures S2 and 2A). The average wheat above-ground height of the three irrigatioj groups changed with time (Figure 2B). Irrigation with FPW5 slightly increased the above-ground height of wheat in the first 20 days, compared with the other two groups, but the wheat treated with TW grew faster at a later stage. The results suggest that the growth of wheat in soil followed an opposite trend compared to germination in the petri dishes, with respect to the use of the three irrigation 213 waters.

214 Irrigation with reused wastewater showed some stress effects. Compared to the control, 215 TFPW irrigation significantly (p < 0.05) increased the root to shoot biomass ratio (R:S ratio). Additionally, irrigation with TFPW and FPW5 significantly (p < 0.05) decreased wheat total 216 217 biomass by approximately 23 % and 10 %, respectively (Figure 2C). The results were in line 218 with the reports suggesting that higher concentration of organic matter in the irrigation water leads to smaller biomass.<sup>21</sup> As presented in Figure 2D, the total yield per spike in TFPW and 219 220 FPW5 groups decreased markedly (p < 0.05) by 34 % and 17 %; the grain weight reduced 221 markedly by 12 % for TFPW irrigation (p < 0.05) and 20 % for FPW5 irrigation (p < 0.05). 222 Among the three irrigation waters, the TOC concentration of TFPW was the highest and 223 equal to 2.9 mg/L, which was however lower than the maximum value of 5 mg/L suggested in the literature.<sup>21</sup> 224



Figure 2. (A) Representative images of mature wheat irrigated with different waters. (B)
Above-ground height of wheat irrigated with different waters in soil. (C) Wheat total biomass
and root-shoot ratio. (D) Total wheat yield per spike and average grain weight.

231	Effect on elements accumulation in soil. As displayed in Figure S3, fifteen elements in
232	the soil, including crop nutrient elements, heavy metal elements, metalloid elements, were
233	measured at the beginning and at the end of the irrigation experiment, with the relative
234	standard deviations (RSDs) presented in Table S1. Compared to the raw soil, the contents of
235	most elements in TFPW-irrigated, TW-irrigated, and FPW5-irrigated soil increased to a
236	certain extent. The accumulation of zinc (Zn), copper (Cu), manganese (Mn), cobalt (Co),
237	nickel (Ni), strontium (Sr), and vanadium (V) in FPW5 soil was much higher than that of the
238	other two groups. On the contrary, molybdenum (Mo), and barium (Ba) accumulated more in
239	TFPW soil and TW soil. The accumulation of heavy metals in soil may not only adversely
240	affects soil biota through microbial processes and soil-microbe interactions, but also harm
241	human health through the food chain.39, 40 Combined with soil environmental quality
242	standards summarized in Table S3, the content of several heavy metals in the soil of each
243	irrigation group were lower than the recommended risk control value, indicating that the
244	irrigation reuse of properly diluted or treated shale gas wastewater within a wheat life cycle
245	might not cause adverse effects on the soil environment. Nevertheless, diluted and treated
246	effluents contributed to addition of chemical components to the soil, which may accumulate
247	over time.

Effect on elements accumulation in wheat tissues. Nutrient elements and toxic heavy metals in plant tissues were measured to provide insights into the translocation and accumulation effects.<sup>40-42</sup> The content of seven nutrient elements and eight toxic elements in wheat root, stem, leaf, and grain are displayed in Figures 3 and 4, respectively, with the 252 relative standard deviations (RSDs) presented in Table S2. Obviously, the accumulation of 253 these elements in wheat leaves was higher than in grains (except for Mg, Zn, Cu, and Mn), 254 indicating that the transport of these elements in wheat affected leaf tissues rather than continuing to reach grains, regardless of the type of irrigation water.<sup>20, 43</sup> Except for Mn and 255 256 Mo, the concentration trends of each element in the experimental groups for different tissues 257 of the plant was consistent. Interestingly, although FPW5 contained higher concentration of 258 substances and salinity, the content of several elements within specific tissues of wheat 259 cultivated with FPW5 were not the highest among the three groups. In fact, the key factor 260 affecting plant osmotic stress may not be the overall salinity gradient itself, but may be related to ion composition and ratios.<sup>27, 44</sup> 261

262 In detail, compared with the TW group, the wheat in the other two groups absorbed and stored more Ca, since Ca could facilitate plant resistance to stress.<sup>45</sup> The K content in the 263 264 wheat cultivated with TFPW increased significantly, and even the content in the roots of the 265 wheat was twice that of the other groups, suggesting that TFPW promoted wheat uptake of K 266 from soil. As shown in Figure 3C, compared with TW and FPW5, the Mg content associated 267 with photosynthesis and carbohydrate synthesis accumulation was relatively higher in wheat 268 leaves irrigated by TFPW. K, Ca and Mg exist in significant amounts in various tissues of 269 plants and play a wide range of roles, including but not limited to regulating cell permeability, 270 activating enzyme, regulating product transport, and participating in cell structure 271 composition. Results in Figure 3 also indicate that the content of Zn, Cu, Mn, and Mo in 272 various tissues of wheat were smaller than that of K, Ca, and Mg by several orders of 273 magnitude. Their presence in trace amounts is essential for plant growth and grain yield, but

toxic when exceeding certain threshold levels.<sup>20, 46</sup> For instance, the presence of high concentrations of Zn and Cu in plants can reduce metabolic activity, generate reactive oxygen species, and induce oxidative damage.<sup>46</sup> Similarly, several toxic heavy metals and metalloids listed in **Figure 4** were classified as non-essential elements for plant growth and might cause serious acute and chronic health hazards to plants and humans. Pb and Cr are also toxic and/or carcinogenic to humans, and can cause damage to the nervous system and to the immune system, causing a variety of diseases similar to excessive As.<sup>40, 47, 48</sup>

281 The actual content of these toxic elements in the grains of wheat are a concern for food safety. 282 As shown in Figure 4B, the accumulation of As in the roots of wheat was much higher than 283 that in the shoots (stem, leaf, grain), which was consistent with what described in a previous study.<sup>49</sup> No significant differences were observed between the content of As in wheat grains 284 285 irrigated by different waters. This study found that only Cr and Pb exceeded the maximum 286 values of 1 mg/kg for Cr and 0.2 mg/kg for Pb recommended by China, while the other metals met the requirements.<sup>50</sup> Specifically, the Pb contents in wheat grains irrigated with 287 288 TFPW and FPW5 were 0.217 mg/kg and 0.226 mg/kg, respectively, slightly above the limit 289 and approximately half that of the TW group. The concentrations of Cr in the three groups of 290 wheat grains were not significantly different (7-10 mg/kg), but were all considerably higher 291 than the limit. Previous studies showed that plants cultivated under controlled indoor 292 conditions were not only polluted by heavy metals from anthropogenic sources, but also more sensitive to heavy metal pollution than open field crops.<sup>40, 51</sup> In addition, the transport of 293 294 many heavy metals in plants were regulated by the same transporter, which led to a 295 competitive relationship in heavy metal accumulation. For example, the translocation and

redistribution of Cd and Zn were regulated by plant cadmium resistance proteins.<sup>52</sup>

297 From the results, it could be concluded that the type of irrigation water was not the main 298 contributor to the grain element contents exceeding the limits. Studies indicate that the uptake 299 of any specific element or compounds by plants depend on several variables, including but 300 not limited to plant species, water quality, soil quality, physicochemical properties of the element or compound, and plant physiology.<sup>53, 54</sup> The differences in the content of elements 301 302 absorbed by plant tissues in each group not only reflect the competition and complexation 303 between the components of irrigation water, but also the comprehensive results of plants 304 responding to various stress conditions.

305



307 Figure 3. Concentrations of K (A), Ca (B), Mg (C), Zn (D), Cu (E), Mn (F), and Mo (G) in

308 wheat tissues, including root, stem, leaf, and grain in wheat cultivated for 65 days applying

310



Figure 4. Concentrations of Cr (A), As (B), Se (C), Ba (D), Pb (E), Cd (F), Ag (G) and Sn (H)
in wheat tissue including root, stem, leaf, and grain in wheat cultivated for 65 days applying
different irrigation waters.

315

Effect on transcriptome sequencing in wheat grains. To better understand the effect of irrigation with shale gas wastewater on wheat grain genetic and physiological basis traits, grains at grain filling stage were used for transcriptome analysis based on the RNA-seq technology.<sup>30, 55</sup> The RNA bands were clear and free of impurities, such as pigments, proteins, and sugars, based on the results reported in **Table S4**. High-quality mapped reads for transcript assembly and expression calculation were obtained, and their derivation distribution and detailed sequencing data are presented in **Tables S5 and S6**, respectively. In this experiment, the total number of known expressed genes in wheat grains irrigated with TFPW, TW, FPW5 was 71570, 70278, and 67836, respectively, with a large amount of co-expressed genes (62788) identified in all detective samples (**Figure S4**).

326 Results indicate that a total of 1973 genes were differentially expressed when comparing the 327 use of TW and TFPW, of which the expression of 1468 genes was up-regulated and that of 328 505 was down-regulated when the irrigation water was TFPW (Figure 5A). In addition, 329 irrigation with FPW5 led to 4606 genes differentially expressed compared with TW control. 330 Among these DEGs, 4003 genes were down-regulated and 603 were up-regulated in TW with 331 respect to FPW5 (Figure 5B). The emergence of up-regulated and down-regulated genes 332 positively and negatively affect the physiological and developmental characteristics of wheat 333 at grain filling stage, respectively, which in turn determined the size and number of mature 334 grains.<sup>56</sup>

335 The aforementioned DEGs in TW vs. TFPW and TW vs. FPW5 were analyzed for functional 336 and biological information using Gene Ontology (GO) and the Kyoto Encyclopedia of Genes 337 and Genomes (KEGG) annotation, respectively. GO annotation analysis showed that the 338 DEGs could be annotated into three categories, namely, biological processes, molecular 339 functions, and cellular components, with the top 20 enriched GO subcategories terms 340 displayed in Figure 6. A high percentage of intersection DEGs related to binding, catalytic 341 activity, cellular process, metabolic process, and cell part were induced by TFPW irrigation 342 water in wheat grains (Figures 6A). However, in the intersection group of TW vs. FPW5, cell 343 part, binding, cellular process, metabolic process, organelle, and catalytic activity apparently 344 ranked as the top six terms (Figures 6B). The detailed regulated genes annotated by the 345 KEGG database were classified into five pathways: metabolism, genetic information 346 processing, environmental information processing, cellular processes, and organismal 347 systems. In the intersection group of TW vs. TFPW, only the number of up-regulated DEGs 348 annotated to carbohydrate metabolism pathways was not higher than that of down-regulated 349 DEGs (Tables S7). Interestingly, the complete opposite trend was ob served in TW vs. FPW5 350 (Tables S8).

351 Furthermore, combined with enrichment analysis, we explored the effect of TFPW and FPW5 352 on major gene functions and metabolic pathways in wheat grain compared to irrigation with 353 TW. Figure 6C shows that, apart from the highest enrichment degree of functional genes that 354 determined cells death (0.34), the genes related to glucosamine-containing compound 355 catabolic process, chitin catabolic process, aminoglycan catabolic process, and cinnamic acid 356 biosynthetic and metabolic process possessed high rich factor (0.2-0.22) among the top 20 357 ranked GO terms of DEGs. In addition, carbohydrate derivative catabolic process, cell killing, 358 glucosamine-containing compound catabolic process, response to reactive oxygen species 359 were more abundant functional groups in comparisons. Figure S5A presents the top 10 360 ranked KEGG pathways of enrichment, of which the highest enrichment was MAPK 361 signaling pathway-plant, followed by amino sugar and nucleotide sugar metabolism, and 362 protein processing in endoplasmic reticulum. Moreover, a large number of DEGs were 363 involved in the phenylpropanoid biosynthesis and phenylalanine metabolism pathways, and 364 starch and sucrose metabolism, which play an important role in plant growth, development

and response to stress. As presented in Figures 6D and S5B, significantly different from TW
vs. TFPW analysis, a large number of DEGs related to DNA replication and ribosome
pathways appeared in TW vs. FPW5 analysis. Genes related to uptake of heavy metals by
plant roots and transport of heavy metals from roots to shoots might be regulated by irrigation
water.

370



Figure 5. Volcano plots of differences in gene expression among (A) TW vs. TFPW and (B)
TW vs. FPW5 analysis. Gray dots were not considered as significantly differentially
expressed. Red (up-regulation) and green (down-regulation) dots indicate DEGs (|log<sub>2</sub> (Fold
Change) | > 1, Padjust (FDR) < 0.05).</li>



Figure 6. Function annotation and enrichment analysis of the intersection differentially expressed genes (DEGs) of wheat grain byased on gene ontology (GO) databases. (A, B): sub-categories of Gene Ontology (GO) terms of the DEGs in TW vs TFPW and TW vs FPW5 analysis, respectively. (C, D): bubble diagram of top 20 ranked GO terms of DEGs in TW vs. TFPW and TW vs. FPW5 analysis, respectively.

383

384	In summary, compared with tap water, TFPW inhibited the total biomass and yield of mature
385	wheat, promoted the accumulation of nutrient elements, and induced the up-regulation of
386	more than half of the differentially expressed genes related to binding, catalytic activity,
387	cellular process, metabolic process. With the continuous use of irrigation water, the content of
388	many elements in the soil increased slightly. Notably, including the TW control, the abnormal
389	accumulation of heavy metals in wheat grains might pose potential health risks to the
390	environment and humans, which require further field studies. In short, the present study
391	provides practical insights into the macro and micro effects of crop growth, toxicological
392	characteristics and gene transcriptional expression differences of shale gas flowback and
393	produced water reuse in farmland irrigation and is useful toward efforts on the proper
394	management as well as optimal treatment of shale gas wastewater.
395	

# **396 ASSOCIATED CONTENT**

# **397 Supporting Information**

398 The supporting information is available free of charge.

399

## 400 AUTHOR INFORMATION

- 401 **Corresponding Author**
- 402 Tel.: +86-28-85995998; Fax: +86-28-62138325; E-mail: <u>bcliu@scu.edu.cn;</u>
- 403 <u>baicangliu@gmail.com</u> (B. Liu).

404

405 Notes

406 The authors declare no competing financial interests.

407

#### 408 ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

409 This work was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (52070134),

410 Litree Purifying Technology Co., Ltd. (2021H012), and Sichuan University and Yibin City

411 People's Government strategic cooperation project (2020CDYB-2).

412

#### 413 **REFERENCES**

414 (1) Yao, L. Y.; Sui, B., Heterogeneous preferences for shale water management: Evidence
415 from a choice experiment in Fuling shale gas field, southwest China. *Energy Policy* 2020,
416 147.

417 (2) Mayfield, E. N.; Cohon, J. L.; Muller, N. Z.; Azevedo, I. M. L.; Robinson, A. L.,
418 Cumulative environmental and employment impacts of the shale gas boom. *Nat Sustain* 2019,
419 2 (12), 1122-1131.

420 (3) Brittingham, M. C.; Maloney, K. O.; Farag, A. M.; Harper, D. D.; Bowen, Z. H.,
421 Ecological risks of shale oil and gas development to wildlife, aquatic resources and their
422 habitats. *Environ Sci Technol* 2014, 48 (19), 11034-11047.

423 (4) Vidic, R. D.; Brantley, S. L.; Vandenbossche, J. M.; Yoxtheimer, D.; Abad, J. D.,
424 Impact of shale gas development on regional water quality. *Science* 2013, *340* (6134),
425 1235009.

426 (5) Scanlon, B. R.; Reedy, R. C.; Xu, P.; Engle, M.; Nicot, J. P.; Yoxtheimer, D.;
427 Yang, Q.; Ikonnikova, S., Can we beneficially reuse produced water from oil and gas
428 extraction in the U.S.? *Sci. Total Environ.* 2020, *717*, 137085.

429 (6) Tang, P.; Liu, B. C.; Zhang, Y. L.; Chang, H. Q.; Zhou, P.; Feng, M. B.;
430 Sharma, V. K., Sustainable reuse of shale gas wastewater by pre-ozonation with
431 ultrafiltration-reverse osmosis. *Chem. Eng. J.* 2020, *392*.

432 (7) Parker, K. M.; Zeng, T.; Harkness, J.; Vengosh, A.; Mitch, W. A., Enhanced
433 formation of disinfection byproducts in shale gas wastewater-impacted drinking water
434 supplies. *Environ Sci Technol* 2014, 48 (19), 11161-11169.

(8) Shaffer, D. L.; Arias Chavez, L. H.; Ben-Sasson, M.; Romero-Vargas Castrillon,
S.; Yip, N. Y.; Elimelech, M., Desalination and reuse of high-salinity shale gas produced
water: drivers, technologies, and future directions. *Environ Sci Technol* 2013, 47 (17),
9569-9583.

439 (9) Mauter, M. S.; Alvarez, P. J.; Burton, A.; Cafaro, D. C.; Chen, W.; Gregory,
440 K. B.; Jiang, G.; Li, Q.; Pittock, J.; Reible, D.; Schnoor, J. L., Regional variation in
441 water-related impacts of shale gas development and implications for emerging international

442 plays. Environ Sci Technol 2014, 48 (15), 8298-8306.

443 (10) Shariq, L.; McLaughlin, M. C.; Rehberg, R. A.; Miller, H.; Blotevogel, J.;
444 Borch, T., Irrigation of wheat with select hydraulic fracturing chemicals: Evaluating plant
445 uptake and growth impacts. *Environ. Pollut.* 2020, 273, 116402.

446 (11) Dolan, F. C.; Cath, T. Y.; Hogue, T. S., Assessing the feasibility of using produced
447 water for irrigation in Colorado. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2018, 640-641, 619-628.

448 (12) Ellsworth, W. L., Injection-induced earthquakes. *Science* **2013**, *341* (6142), 449 1225942.

450 (13) McLaughlin, M. C.; Blotevogel, J.; Watson, R. A.; Schell, B.; Blewett, T. A.;

Folkerts, E. J.; Goss, G. G.; Truong, L.; Tanguay, R. L.; Argueso, J. L.; Borch, T.,
Mutagenicity assessment downstream of oil and gas produced water discharges intended for
agricultural beneficial reuse. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2020, *715*, 136944.

454 (14) Ferrer, I.; Thurman, E. M., Chemical constituents and analytical approaches for 455 hydraulic fracturing waters. *Trends Environ Anal* **2015**, *5*, 18-25.

456 (15) Shariq, L., Uncertainties associated with the reuse of treated hydraulic fracturing
457 wastewater for crop irrigation. *Environ Sci Technol* 2013, 47 (6), 2435-2436.

458 (16) Tang, P.; Xie, W.; Tiraferri, A.; Zhang, Y.; Zhu, J.; Li, J.; Lin, D.;
459 Crittenden, J. C.; Liu, B., Organics removal from shale gas wastewater by pre-oxidation
460 combined with biologically active filtration. *Water Res.* 2021, *196*, 117041.

461 (17) Miller, H.; Dias, K.; Hare, H.; Borton, M. A.; Blotevogel, J.; Danforth, C.;
462 Wrighton, K. C.; Ippolito, J. A.; Borch, T., Reusing oil and gas produced water for
463 agricultural irrigation: Effects on soil health and the soil microbiome. *Sci. Total Environ.*464 2020, 722, 137888.

(18) Chang, H. Q.; Li, T.; Liu, B. C.; Vidic, R. D.; Elimelech, M.; Crittenden, J.
C., Potential and implemented membrane-based technologies for the treatment and reuse of
flowback and produced water from shale gas and oil plays: A review. *Desalination* 2019, 455,
34-57.

469 (19) Hejase, C. A.; Weitzel, K. A.; Stokes, S. C.; Grauberger, B. M.; Young, R. B.;
470 Arias-Paic, M. S.; Kong, M.; Chae, S.; Bandhauer, T. M.; Tong, T.; Herber, D. R.;
471 Stout, S.; Miara, A.; Huang, Z.; Evans, A.; Kurup, P.; Talmadge, M.; Kandt, A.;
472 Stokes-Draut, J. R.; Macknick, J.; Borch, T.; Dionysiou, D. D., Opportunities for
473 Treatment and Reuse of Agricultural Drainage in the United States. ACS ES&T Engineering
474 2021, 2 (3), 292-305.

(20) Sedlacko, E. M.; Chaparro, J. M.; Heuberger, A. L.; Cath, T. Y.; Higgins, C. P.,
Effect of produced water treatment technologies on irrigation-induced metal and salt
accumulation in wheat (Triticum aestivum) and sunflower (Helianthus annuus). *Sci. Total Environ.* 2020, 740, 140003.

479 (21) Pica, N. E.; Carlson, K.; Steiner, J. J.; Waskom, R., Produced water reuse for
480 irrigation of non-food biofuel crops: Effects on switchgrass and rapeseed germination,
481 physiology and biomass yield. *Ind Crop Prod* 2017, *100*, 65-76.

482 (22) Cooper, C. M.; McCall, J.; Stokes, S. C.; McKay, C.; Bentley, M. J.;
483 Rosenblum, J. S.; Blewett, T. A.; Huang, Z.; Miara, A.; Talmadge, M.; Evans, A.;
484 Sitterley, K. A.; Kurup, P.; Stokes-Draut, J. R.; Macknick, J.; Borch, T.; Cath, T. Y.;
485 Katz, L. E., Oil and Gas Produced Water Reuse: Opportunities, Treatment Needs, and

486 Challenges. *ACS ES&T Engineering* **2021**.

487 (23) Pichtel, J., Oil and Gas Production Wastewater: Soil Contamination and Pollution
488 Prevention. *Appl. Environ. Soil Sci.* 2016, 2016, 1-24.

(24) Tian, L.; Chang, H. Q.; Tang, P.; Li, T.; Zhang, X. F.; Liu, S.; He, Q. P.;
Wang, T.; Yang, J. Q.; Bai, Y. H.; Vidic, R. D.; Crittenden, J. C.; Liu, B. C., Rare
Earth Elements Occurrence and Economical Recovery Strategy from Shale Gas Wastewater
in the Sichuan Basin, China. *Acs Sustain Chem Eng* 2020, *8* (32), 11914-11920.

493 (25) Andresen, E.; Peiter, E.; Kupper, H., Trace metal metabolism in plants. J. Exp. Bot.
494 2018, 69 (5), 909-954.

(26) Kondash, A. J.; Redmon, J. H.; Lambertini, E.; Feinstein, L.; Weinthal, E.;
Cabrales, L.; Vengosh, A., The impact of using low-saline oilfield produced water for
irrigation on water and soil quality in California. *Sci. Total Environ.* 2020, 733, 139392.

498 (27) Sedlacko, E. M.; Jahn, C. E.; Heuberger, A. L.; Sindt, N. M.; Miller, H. M.;
499 Borch, T.; Blaine, A. C.; Cath, T. Y.; Higgins, C. P., Potential for Beneficial Reuse of Oil
500 and Gas-Derived Produced Water in Agriculture: Physiological and Morphological Responses
501 in Spring Wheat (Triticum aestivum). *Environ. Toxicol. Chem.* 2019, *38* (8), 1756-1769.

502 (28) Miller, H.; Trivedi, P.; Qiu, Y. H.; Sedlacko, E. M.; Higgins, C. P.; Borch, T.,
503 Food Crop Irrigation with Oilfield-Produced Water Suppresses Plant Immune Response.
504 Environ Sci Tech Let 2019, 6 (11), 656-661.

505 (29) Integrated Wastewater Discharge Standard (GB 8978 1996). State Technology
 506 Supervision Bureau of China: 1996.

507 (30) Zhou, Y.; Zhao, X.; Li, Y.; Xu, J.; Bi, A.; Kang, L.; Xu, D.; Chen, H.;
508 Wang, Y.; Wang, Y. G.; Liu, S.; Jiao, C.; Lu, H.; Wang, J.; Yin, C.; Jiao, Y.; Lu,
509 F., Triticum population sequencing provides insights into wheat adaptation. *Nat. Genet.* 2020,
510 52 (12), 1412-1422.

(31) Novichkova, A.; Shang, W.; Yang, Y.; Qiao, X.; Tang, Y.; Liu, B., Effect of
Ultrafiltration–Reverse-Osmosis-Treated Shale Gas Wastewater on Seed Germination and
Plant Growth. *Energy Fuels* 2020, *35* (2), 1629-1637.

514 (32) Lian, J.; Wu, J.; Xiong, H.; Zeb, A.; Yang, T.; Su, X.; Su, L.; Liu, W., 515 Impact of polystyrene nanoplastics (PSNPs) on seed germination and seedling growth of 516 wheat (Triticum aestivum L.). *J. Hazard. Mater.* **2020**, *385*, 121620.

(33) Oetjen, K.; Giddings, C. G. S.; McLaughlin, M.; Nell, M.; Blotevogel, J.;
Helbling, D. E.; Mueller, D.; Higgins, C. P., Emerging analytical methods for the
characterization and quantification of organic contaminants in flowback and produced water. *Trends Environ Anal* 2017, *15*, 12-23.

521 (34) Dahm, K. G.; Guerra, K. L.; Xu, P.; Drewes, J. E., Composite geochemical
522 database for coalbed methane produced water quality in the Rocky Mountain region. *Environ*523 Sci Technol 2011, 45 (18), 7655-7663.

(35) Chang, H.; Liu, S.; Tong, T.; He, Q.; Crittenden, J. C.; Vidic, R. D.; Liu, B.,
On-Site Treatment of Shale Gas Flowback and Produced Water in Sichuan Basin by Fertilizer
Drawn Forward Osmosis for Irrigation. *Environ Sci Technol* 2020, *54* (17), 10926-10935.

527 (36) Standard for irrigation water quality (GB 5084—2021). Ministry of Ecology and 528 Environment of the People's Republic of China: 2021.

529 (37) The reuse of urban recycling water - Quality of farmland irrigation water (GB

530 20922-2007). General administration of quality supervision, inspection and quarantine of 531 China and Standardization Administration of China: 2007. 532 (38) Ayers, R. S.; Westcot, D. W., Water quality for agriculture. Food and Agriculture 533 Organization of the United Nations Rome: 1985; Vol. 29. 534 (39) Gadd, G. M., Metals, minerals and microbes: geomicrobiology and bioremediation. 535 Microbiology (Read.) 2010, 156 (Pt 3), 609-643. 536 (40) Rai, P. K.; Lee, S. S.; Zhang, M.; Tsang, Y. F.; Kim, K. H., Heavy metals in 537 food crops: Health risks, fate, mechanisms, and management. Environ. Int. 2019, 125, 538 365-385. 539 (41) Baxter, I., Ionomics: studying the social network of mineral nutrients. Curr. Opin. 540 Plant Biol. 2009, 12 (3), 381-386. 541 Singh, S.; Sinha, S.; Saxena, R.; Pandey, K.; Bhatt, K., Translocation of metals (42) 542 and its effects in the tomato plants grown on various amendments of tannery waste: evidence 543 for involvement of antioxidants. Chemosphere 2004, 57 (2), 91-99. 544 (43) Page, V.; Feller, U., Heavy Metals in Crop Plants: Transport and Redistribution 545 Processes on the Whole Plant Level. Agronomy-Basel 2015, 5 (3), 447-463. 546 (44) Kumari, A.; Das, P.; Parida, A. K.; Agarwal, P. K., Proteomics, metabolomics, 547 and ionomics perspectives of salinity tolerance in halophytes. Front Plant Sci 2015, 6 (JULY), 548 537. 549 (45) Kader, M. A.; Lindberg, S., Cytosolic calcium and pH signaling in plants under 550 salinity stress. Plant Signal Behav 2010, 5 (3), 233-238. 551 (46) Edelstein, M.; Ben-Hur, M., Heavy metals and metalloids: Sources, risks and 552 strategies to reduce their accumulation in horticultural crops. Scientia Horticulturae 2018, 553 234, 431-444. 554 (47) El-Kady, A. A.; Abdel-Wahhab, M. A., Occurrence of trace metals in foodstuffs and 555 their health impact. Trends Food Sci. Technol. 2018, 75, 36-45. 556 (48) Zhuang, P.; McBride, M. B.; Xia, H.; Li, N.; Li, Z., Health risk from heavy 557 metals via consumption of food crops in the vicinity of Dabaoshan mine, South China. Sci. 558 Total Environ. 2009, 407 (5), 1551-1561. 559 (49) Pigna, M.; Caporale, A. G.; Cavalca, L.; Sommella, A.; Violante, A., Arsenic 560 in the Soil Environment: Mobility and Phytoavailability. Environ. Eng. Sci. 2015, 32 (7), 561 551-563. 562 (50) National food safety standard. State Administration for Market Regulation: 2017. 563 (51) Liu, J.; Zhang, X. H.; Tran, H.; Wang, D. Q.; Zhu, Y. N., Heavy metal 564 contamination and risk assessment in water, paddy soil, and rice around an electroplating 565 plant. Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. Int. 2011, 18 (9), 1623-1632. 566 (52) Qiao, K.; Tian, Y.; Hu, Z.; Chai, T., Wheat Cell Number Regulator CNR10 567 Enhances the Tolerance, Translocation, and Accumulation of Heavy Metals in Plants. Environ 568 Sci Technol 2019, 53 (2), 860-867. 569 (53) Carter, L. J.; Williams, M.; Bottcher, C.; Kookana, R. S., Uptake of 570 Pharmaceuticals Influences Plant Development and Affects Nutrient and Hormone 571 Homeostases. Environ Sci Technol 2015, 49 (20), 12509-12518. 572 (54) Verkleij, J. A. C.; Golan-Goldhirsh, A.; Antosiewisz, D. M.; Schwitzguebel, J. 573 P.; Schroder, P., Dualities in plant tolerance to pollutants and their uptake and translocation to

574 the upper plant parts. *Environ. Exp. Bot.* **2009**, 67 (1), 10-22.

575 (55) Ramirez-Gonzalez, R. H.; Borrill, P.; Lang, D.; Harrington, S. A.; Brinton, J.; 576 Venturini, L.; Davey, M.; Jacobs, J.; van Ex, F.; Pasha, A.; Khedikar, Y.; Robinson, 577 S. J.; Cory, A. T.; Florio, T.; Concia, L.; Juery, C.; Schoonbeek, H.; Steuernagel, 578 B.; Xiang, D.; Ridout, C. J.; Chalhoub, B.; Mayer, K. F. X.; Benhamed, M.; 579 Latrasse, D.; Bendahmane, A.; International Wheat Genome Sequencing, C.; Wulff, B. 580 B. H.; Appels, R.; Tiwari, V.; Datla, R.; Choulet, F.; Pozniak, C. J.; Provart, N. J.; 581 Sharpe, A. G.; Paux, E.; Spannagl, M.; Brautigam, A.; Uauy, C., The transcriptional 582 landscape of polyploid wheat. Science 2018, 361 (6403), 662-+. 583 (56) Munns, R.; James, R. A.; Xu, B.; Athman, A.; Conn, S. J.; Jordans, C.;

Byrt, C. S.; Hare, R. A.; Tyerman, S. D.; Tester, M.; Plett, D.; Gilliham, M., Wheat
grain yield on saline soils is improved by an ancestral Na(+) transporter gene. *Nat. Biotechnol.* 2012, 30 (4), 360-364.

587

# **Table of Contents:**

