POLITECNICO DI TORINO Repository ISTITUZIONALE

Semi-continuous anaerobic digestion of mixed wastewater sludge with biochar addition

Original

Semi-continuous anaerobic digestion of mixed wastewater sludge with biochar addition / Chiappero, M.; Berruti, F.; Masek, O.; Fiore, S. - In: BIORESOURCE TECHNOLOGY. - ISSN 0960-8524. - ELETTRONICO. - 340:(2021), p. 125664. [10.1016/j.biortech.2021.125664]

Availability: This version is available at: 11583/2926034 since: 2021-09-21T14:59:28Z

Publisher: Elsevier Ltd

Published DOI:10.1016/j.biortech.2021.125664

Terms of use:

This article is made available under terms and conditions as specified in the corresponding bibliographic description in the repository

Publisher copyright

(Article begins on next page)

1	Semi-continuous anaerobic digestion of mixed wastewater sludge with biochar						
2	addition						
3	Marco Chiappero ^a , Franco Berruti ^b , Ondřej Mašek ^c , Silvia Fiore ^a *						
4							
5	a DIATI (Department of Engineering for Environment, Land and Infrastructures),						
6	Politecnico di Torino, Corso Duca degli Abruzzi 24, 10129, Torino, Italy						
7	b Institute for Chemicals and Fuels from Alternative Resources (ICFAR), Department						
8	of Chemical and Biochemical Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, Western University,						
9	London, Ontario, N6A 5B9, Canada						
10	c UK Biochar Research Centre (UKBRC), School of GeoSciences, University of						
11	Edinburgh, King's Buildings, Edinburgh EH9 3JN, United Kingdom						
12							
13	*corresponding author: Prof. Silvia Fiore, DIATI, Politecnico di Torino, Corso Duca						
14	degli Abruzzi, 24; 10129, Torino, Italy; E-mail: silvia.fiore@polito.it; Phone: +39 011						
15	090 7613						
16							
17	Abstract						
18	This work analysed the effects of biochar (BC) addition to the anaerobic digestion (AD)						
19	of wastewater mixed sludge (MS) in semi-continuous mode. A 3 L digester was						
20	operated at 37 °C for 100 days, feeding MS collected every three weeks in the same						
21	wastewater treatment plant, and 10 g L^{-1} of BC. The average performance of MS						
22	digestion (biogas 188 NmL d ⁻¹ , 68% methane) improved in presence of BC (biogas 244						
23	NmL d ⁻¹ , 69% methane). According to the results of the multiple linear regression						
24	analysis performed on the experimental data, the 79% variation of the soluble COD in						

25	the MS was the driving factor for the 38% increase of biogas and methane yields. In
26	conclusion, in the considered experimental conditions, the variability of the substrate's
27	composition was the key factor driving the performances of the AD of MS,
28	independently of the addition of BC.
29	
30	Keywords
31	biochar; biogas; linear regression; sludge; wastewater
32	
33	1. Introduction
34	Wastewater treatment plants (WWTP) in Europe produce currently over 10 Mt/year of
35	wastewater sludge (expressed as dry substance) (Eurostat, 2021). Sludge management is
36	a critical issue for WWTPs, implying significant impacts on their operating costs
37	(Appels et al., 2010) and environmental footprint (Gherghel et al., 2019). In the past
38	decade, many WWTP operators have implemented AD as part of the sludge
39	management processes to recover energy. The optimization of biogas production from
40	wastewater sludge could heavily improve the energy balance of a WWTP (Gu et al.,
41	2017; Jenicek et al., 2013). Even if anaerobic digestion (AD) is commonly applied in
42	full-scale WWTPs, it still has critical issues that need to be addressed to improve its
43	performance. Particularly in the case of waste activated sludge, the complex floc
44	structure and the recalcitrant cell walls limit the hydrolysis and the overall
45	implementation of AD (Zhen et al., 2017), resulting in scarce methane yields and high
46	retention times. Further, the presence of inhibitory substances in the sludge may limit
47	methane production (Alenzi et al., 2021; Mohammad Mirsoleimani Azizi et al., 2021).
48	To improve the AD of wastewater sludge, different options have been widely

49 investigated, including physicochemical pre-treatments (Khanh Nguyen et al., 2021; 50 Zhen et al., 2017), and co-digestion with other substrates (Chow et al., 2020; Elalami et 51 al., 2019). At the same time the financial and environmental impacts of the proposed 52 solutions (i.e., use of chemicals and energy demand) should be contained. A recent 53 perspective in this framework considered the use of additives, mostly carbon-based 54 materials (e.g. biochar, activated carbon, graphene, carbon fibres) (Lu et al., 2020), with 55 the aim of improving methane production, AD stability, and digestate quality (Abbas et 56 al., 2021). Among carbon-based additives, biochar (BC) has been receiving increasing 57 attention due to its low cost and environmental sustainability, and the ability to increase 58 methane yield (Chiappero et al., 2020). BC is the solid residue of the thermo-chemical 59 pyrolytic treatment of biomass with limited or no oxygen, and it may derive from many 60 waste biomasses (Li et al., 2019). BC has become highly attractive for many 61 applications (Zhang et al., 2019), due to the wide variety of distinctive properties, 62 including large surface area and porous structure, rich surface functionalities, high ion 63 exchange capacity and adsorption ability. Specifically considering BC as additive in the 64 AD of wastewater sludge, increased methane yields and production rates were observed 65 (Chiappero et al., 2021). The large surface area and porous structure of BC provides a 66 suitable habitat for microbial attachment and colonization during AD (Yin et al., 2019; 67 Zhang et al., 2019). BC was shown to stimulate all phases of AD, from hydrolysis and acidogenesis (Wei et al., 2020; S. Xu et al., 2020; Yin et al., 2019), to acetogenesis and 68 69 methanogenesis (Lü et al., 2020; Shen et al., 2021). It has been suggested that BC 70 stimulates the syntrophic metabolisms between fermentative bacteria and methanogens 71 (Lü et al., 2020; Shen et al., 2021) by facilitating interspecies electron transfer on its 72 surface functional groups (Wang et al., 2020; Wang et al., 2018). Further, when

73 supplemented to the AD of wastewater sludge, BC increases the alkalinity of the 74 system, thanks to the content of alkali and alkaline earth metals (Shen et al., 2016; Zhou 75 et al., 2020), and mitigates ammonia inhibition (Shen et al., 2017; Zhang et al., 2019). 76 Conversely, inhibitory effects on methane production from wastewater sludge were 77 observed in case of excessive loads of BC by several authors (Wei et al., 2020; Wu et 78 al., 2019; Zhang et al., 2019; Zhang and Wang, 2020). Despite the variable effects on 79 AD due to the differences in the features of the BC, the above cited studies proved the 80 enhancement of methane production during batch AD experiments, suggesting different 81 potential mechanisms. Taking into account the experimental conditions involving 82 continuously-fed digesters, the only available studies reporting positive effects of BC on 83 methane production concerned primary sludge in thermophilic conditions (Wei et al., 84 2020) and temperature-phased semi-continuous AD of mixed sludge (Shen et al., 2017). 85 To our knowledge, the effects of BC supplementation on the AD of wastewater sludge 86 under "realistic" AD conditions (e.g., mixing primary and secondary sludge and 87 accounting the variability of the characteristics of the sludge sampled in a certain 88 WWTP), have not been explored yet. Full-scale WWTPs mostly feed AD with mixed 89 sludge (primary and waste activated sludge), in continuous mode. The intrinsic high 90 variability of the physicochemical features of the sludge in the same facility (Arhoun et 91 al., 2019; Panepinto et al., 2016), which influences the performance of the AD, is well-92 known and should be considered as a key factor. The present study aims to investigate 93 the effects of BC addition on the AD of wastewater sludge under operating conditions 94 simulating common full-scale installations, e.g., mesophilic AD of mixed sludge 95 sampled multiple times in the same WWTP during a period of over three months. A 3 L 96 reactor was operated at 37 °C in semi-continuous mode over 100 days, feeding mixed

97 sludge sampled from the same WWTP every three weeks. The specific objectives of the

98 study were: 1. investigating the effect of BC addition on raw mixed sludge (no pre-

99 treatments), also accounting for the variability of the substrate, on biogas yield and

100 composition; 2. exploring the relationship among BC addition, sludge biodegradability

101 and AD performance through a linear regression approach.

102

103 2. Material and Methods

104 2.1. Substrate, inoculum, and biochar

105 Mixed sludge (MS) was sampled from a WWTP in northern Piedmont, Italy every three

106 weeks (4 samplings in total). The MS was collected at the outflow of the dynamic

107 settling tank receiving primary sludge and waste activated sludge before the AD,

108 obtaining representative samples (30 L). At each sampling, the MS was characterized

109 (see section 2.3) and stored at 4 °C. The inoculum employed for the start-up of the AD

110 process was sampled from the digester operating at 37 °C in the same WWTP.

111 The biochar (Sewage Sludge - SS550a) considered in this work was selected among

112 other BCs according to the results of previous studies as discussed in Section 2.2

113 (Chiappero et al., 2021, Chiappero et al., *under review*). SS550 is a "standard" BC

114 produced at the UK Biochar Research Centre (UKBRC) at the University of Edinburgh,

115 UK (Mašek et al., 2018), through the slow pyrolysis of sewage sludge pellets at 550 °C

116 in a continuously fed rotary kiln pyrolyzer (inner diameter 0.244 m, heated length 2.8

m) with mean residence time of 30 min. Subsequently, the BC underwent physical

activation with CO₂ at the Institute for Chemicals and Fuels from Alternative Resources

119 (ICFAR) at Western University, Canada. Physical activation was performed in a

120 horizontal 316 stainless steel tubular reactor 19 mm in diameter and 0.9 m long. The

biochar was placed between two stainless-steel woven mesh pads and the activation was
carried out in a furnace at 900°C with a constant CO₂ flow rate of 200 mL/min and a
holding time of 60 minutes. Therefore, the BC considered in this work was defined as
"SS550a" (i.e., "SS550" according to the reference ID adopted at UKBRC, and "a" to
refer to its activation).

126

127 2.2. Semi-continuous anaerobic digestion test

128 A lab-scale (3 L working volume) continuously stirred stainless-steel reactor (Methan 129 Tube®, Biological Care, Italy) (Figure 1) was operated under a semi-continuous feeding 130 mode for 100 days. The temperature was set to 37 °C (\pm 0.4 °C) and controlled through 131 a built-in heater. Continuous mechanical mixing (75 rpm, reversed every 5 min) was 132 provided by a brushless DC motor. For the start-up of the AD process, the digester was 133 filled with digestate (see section 2.1), previously stored at 37 °C for 5 days. Once a day, 134 at the same time after vigorous mixing, 0.150 L of MS at 3 % of TS load was manually 135 fed to the reactor and 0.150 L of digestate automatically discharged, resulting in a 136 hydraulic retention time (HRT) equal to 20 days and an OLR in the range 0.9-1.4 gvs L⁻ 137 ¹ d⁻¹. The AD tests involved two consequent phases. Phase 1 (control phase, CTRL): 138 from day 0 to day 49, the digester was fed with MS. At day 31, a slight decrease of pH 139 and total alkalinity was observed, thus the initial HRT equal to 15 days was adjusted to 20 days. Phase 2: from day 50 to 100, 10 g L⁻¹ of BC was supplemented to the digester, 140 141 feeding 1.5 g of BC and 0.150 mL of MS daily. This BC dose, recently used by other 142 studies on the AD of wastewater sludge (Kaur et al., 2020; Liang et al., 2021; Wang et 143 al., 2020) was selected based on the results of previous mesophilic AD batch tests 144 performed on sludge sampled in the same WWTP and supplementing the same SS550s

145	BC, where it was found to enhance the methane yield from MS by 22 % (Chiappero et
146	al., under review) and from waste activated sludge by 17 % (Chiappero et al., 2021), in
147	order to investigate its effects on AD in semi-continuous feeding mode.
148	
149	Figure 1. Configuration of the 3 L stainless-steel reactor: (1) motor and mixer; (2) gas
150	outlet; (3) closing screws; (4) discharging port; (5) silicone stopper; (6) inflow; (7)
151	heater connection; (8) outflow.
152	
153	2.3. Analytical procedures
154	MS was characterized at every sampling (see section 2.1) and digestate was analysed
155	every 3-4 days to monitor the key operating key parameters. pH and electrical
156	conductivity (EC) were measured using a pH80+DHS (XS Instruments) multi-meter.
157	Total solids (TS) and volatile solids (VS) were determined according to Standard
158	Methods (APHA-AWWA-WEF, 2005). The total alkalinity (TA) was measured using
159	the 2320B volumetric/potentiometric method (APHA-AWWA-WEF, 2005), on 40 mL
160	of 1:10 diluted digestate titrated to pH 4.5 with 0.02 N hydrochloric acid. Total and
161	soluble chemical oxygen demand (tCOD and sCOD), organic acids, and ammonia
162	nitrogen were analyzed using Nanocolor test kits (Macherey-Nagel, Germany) and a
163	PF-12 ^{Plus} photometer (Macherey-Nagel, Germany). The samples were centrifuged
164	(6,000 rpm for 10 min) and the supernatant used for ammonia nitrogen determination.
165	The supernatant was filtered on 0.45 μm cellulose acetate membranes and analyzed for
166	sCOD and organic acids. All analyses were carried out at least in duplicate.
167	The parameters and analytical procedures involved in the characterization of the BC are
168	detailed in the Appendix.

169	Biogas production was monitored daily through a gas flow meter (μ Flow, Bioprocess
170	Control, Sweden), automatically normalized to standard temperature and pressure (0 $^{\circ}$ C,
171	1 atm). Biogas was collected in a 10 L gas sampling bag (30229-U, Supelco) and
172	characterized (methane, carbon dioxide, hydrogen sulfide and oxygen) three times per
173	week through an Optima 7 Biogas analyser (Mru GmbH, Germany).
174	
175	2.4. Data analysis
176	During the AD test, mean and standard error of the different parameters were
177	determined for the time periods in which a constant organic loading rate (OLR) was fed
178	to the digester. The relationship among BC addition, sludge characteristics and AD
179	performances was assessed through single and multiple linear regression analyses.
180	
181	2.5. Preliminary economic analysis
181 182	2.5. Preliminary economic analysisA simplified economic analysis was carried out to estimate the maximum unit cost of
181 182 183	 2.5. Preliminary economic analysis A simplified economic analysis was carried out to estimate the maximum unit cost of BC (USD kg⁻¹) that equals the higher revenues deriving from BC supplementation to the
181 182 183 184	 2.5. Preliminary economic analysis A simplified economic analysis was carried out to estimate the maximum unit cost of BC (USD kg⁻¹) that equals the higher revenues deriving from BC supplementation to the AD process. The input data of the AD process (Appendix) correspond to real tested
181 182 183 184 185	 2.5. Preliminary economic analysis A simplified economic analysis was carried out to estimate the maximum unit cost of BC (USD kg⁻¹) that equals the higher revenues deriving from BC supplementation to the AD process. The input data of the AD process (Appendix) correspond to real tested conditions from the present study and recent literature, comparing five AD scenarios
181 182 183 184 185 186	 2.5. Preliminary economic analysis A simplified economic analysis was carried out to estimate the maximum unit cost of BC (USD kg⁻¹) that equals the higher revenues deriving from BC supplementation to the AD process. The input data of the AD process (Appendix) correspond to real tested conditions from the present study and recent literature, comparing five AD scenarios (PS, MS, food waste, and co-digestion of sewage sludge), where BC was supplemented
181 182 183 184 185 186 187	 2.5. Preliminary economic analysis A simplified economic analysis was carried out to estimate the maximum unit cost of BC (USD kg⁻¹) that equals the higher revenues deriving from BC supplementation to the AD process. The input data of the AD process (Appendix) correspond to real tested conditions from the present study and recent literature, comparing five AD scenarios (PS, MS, food waste, and co-digestion of sewage sludge), where BC was supplemented to the continuous or semi-continuous digesters, at lab- or pilot-scale. Considering the
181 182 183 184 185 186 187 188	 2.5. Preliminary economic analysis A simplified economic analysis was carried out to estimate the maximum unit cost of BC (USD kg⁻¹) that equals the higher revenues deriving from BC supplementation to the AD process. The input data of the AD process (Appendix) correspond to real tested conditions from the present study and recent literature, comparing five AD scenarios (PS, MS, food waste, and co-digestion of sewage sludge), where BC was supplemented to the continuous or semi-continuous digesters, at lab- or pilot-scale. Considering the costs, the simplified analysis was based exclusively on the cost of the BC; the capital
181 182 183 184 185 186 187 188 189	 2.5. Preliminary economic analysis A simplified economic analysis was carried out to estimate the maximum unit cost of BC (USD kg⁻¹) that equals the higher revenues deriving from BC supplementation to the AD process. The input data of the AD process (Appendix) correspond to real tested conditions from the present study and recent literature, comparing five AD scenarios (PS, MS, food waste, and co-digestion of sewage sludge), where BC was supplemented to the continuous or semi-continuous digesters, at lab- or pilot-scale. Considering the costs, the simplified analysis was based exclusively on the cost of the BC; the capital costs and operational costs associated with the eventual improvement of the mixing
181 182 183 184 185 186 187 188 189 190	 2.5. Preliminary economic analysis A simplified economic analysis was carried out to estimate the maximum unit cost of BC (USD kg⁻¹) that equals the higher revenues deriving from BC supplementation to the AD process. The input data of the AD process (Appendix) correspond to real tested conditions from the present study and recent literature, comparing five AD scenarios (PS, MS, food waste, and co-digestion of sewage sludge), where BC was supplemented to the continuous or semi-continuous digesters, at lab- or pilot-scale. Considering the costs, the simplified analysis was based exclusively on the cost of the BC; the capital costs and operational costs associated with the eventual improvement of the mixing inside the digester (due to the TS increase caused by BC) were not involved.
181 182 183 184 185 186 187 188 189 190 191	 2.5. Preliminary economic analysis A simplified economic analysis was carried out to estimate the maximum unit cost of BC (USD kg⁻¹) that equals the higher revenues deriving from BC supplementation to the AD process. The input data of the AD process (Appendix) correspond to real tested conditions from the present study and recent literature, comparing five AD scenarios (PS, MS, food waste, and co-digestion of sewage sludge), where BC was supplemented to the continuous or semi-continuous digesters, at lab- or pilot-scale. Considering the costs, the simplified analysis was based exclusively on the cost of the BC; the capital costs and operational costs associated with the eventual improvement of the mixing inside the digester (due to the TS increase caused by BC) were not involved. Considering the revenues, it was assumed that they derive from the "extra" (compared

193 with production of electrical energy in a combined heat and power (CHP) unit and

194 supplying the thermal energy to the plant's energy needs. In details, the extra methane

195 production was calculated as difference between the yield of BC amended reactors

196 minus that of control reactors. The net economic profit was estimated given the methane

197 lower heating value, the electrical energy efficiency of the CHP, and the average EU-27

198 electricity price for non-household consumers (Appendix).

199

200 **3. Results and Discussion**

201 3.1. Characterization of substrate, inoculum, and biochar

202 The average characteristics of the MS and of the inoculum are reported in Table 1. MS

showed the typical characteristics of a mixed sludge (in average, pH 6.0 and TS 3.1%-

wt). BC supplementation increased TS correspondingly to the dose of $10 \text{ g } l^{-1}$, and

205 reduced VS/TS due to the high ash content of the BC.

206

Table 1. Chemical characteristics of the mixed sludge, mixed sludge with 10 g L⁻¹ of SS550a biochar, and the digestate. Data are expressed as average \pm standard error (number of values).

210

211 Considering the characteristics of the BC (see Appendix), the most significant are as

follows. The specific surface area (109.2 m² g⁻¹) and total pore volume (0.169 cm³ g⁻¹)

are the result of the physical activation. The relevant ash content (58.9%-wt) and low

total carbon (29.5%-wt) are expected based on the composition of the parent wastewater

sludge (Metcalf & Eddy, 2013) from which the BC derives. The significant content of

216 micro-elements contributed to the electrical conductivity (28 S m⁻¹) and to the alkaline

217	pH (8.17). The main mineral constituents were Si, Al, Ca, S, P, K, present in the parent
218	biomass and concentrated during the pyrolysis (Souza et al., 2021). Nutrients and alkali
219	and alkaline earth metals are present in significant concentrations, compared to plant-
220	based BCs (Qambrani et al., 2017). An adequate amount of alkali and alkaline earth
221	metals in BC can contribute to the buffering capacity (Kaur et al., 2020). The H/C and
222	O/C atomic ratios (respectively 0.54 and 0.17), indicate an intermediate hydrophobicity
223	of the BC, in agreement with the literature (Zhang et al., 2020).
224	
225	Figure 2. Biogas, methane, and carbon dioxide production during the semi-continuous
226	AD of mixed sludge with and without BC: (A) Gas production as NmL d ⁻¹ ; (B) Gas

production as NmL g tCOD⁻¹ d⁻¹; (C) Gas production as NmL g vs⁻¹ d⁻¹; (D) CH₄, CO₂,

and H₂S concentration; (E) Organic loading rate as $g_{VS} L^{-1} d^{-1}$ and g tCOD $L^{-1} d^{-1}$.

229

230 *3.2. Biogas and methane production*

As detailed in section 2.2, the digester was fed for the first 50 days with MS (CTRL

232 phase), and from day 51 to 100 supplementing 10 g l^{-1} of BC. Figure 2 shows the

233 production of biogas, methane and carbon dioxide, biogas composition and OLR during

the different stages of the AD test. The MS was sampled four times during the test, and

- 235 different physico-chemical features were observed (Table 1), thus the change of the
- substrate composition (specifically, VS/TS, tCOD and sCOD) and, consequently, of the
- 237 organic loading rate (OLR) determined five constant sub-phases (Figure 2E): 1 to 3
- during CTRL phase, 4 and 5 during BC addition.

Table 2. Summary of the experimental results of the semi-continuous AD test, in eachphase, reported as average (standard error).

243 The results of the AD test are detailed in Table 2. Daily biogas and methane yields 244 (Figure 1A) reached stability around day 10, implying the conclusion of the start-up 245 phase. Overall, during the experimental phase, biogas yield was in the range of 408-1120 NmL d⁻¹ and methane yield in the range of 315-724 NmL d⁻¹. During the CTRL 246 stage, biogas yield slightly decreased from phase 1 to 3 (from 791 \pm 45 NmL d⁻¹ to 637 247 248 \pm 28 NmL d⁻¹), and during phase 4 in the presence of BC (527 \pm 18 NmL d⁻¹) until day 74, when a sharp increase occurred at the beginning of phase 5 (917 \pm 26 NmL d⁻¹). 249 250 Methane yield showed a similar trend, with a decline from a 525 ± 28 NmL d⁻¹ in phase 1 during CTRL to 379 ± 19 NmL d⁻¹ in phase 4, followed by an increase to 636 ± 19 251 252 NmL d⁻¹ in phase 5. It should be noticed that BC supplementation from day 50 did not 253 seem to correspond to any variation of the decreasing trends observed for biogas and 254 methane yields from phase 1 to 4. Conversely, the sharp increase at day 74 during the 255 BC addition corresponded to a change in MS composition: sCOD of the MS was 1555 \pm 5 mg L⁻¹ in phase 1, 1123 \pm 11 mg L⁻¹ in phase 2 and 3, 1870 \pm 90 mg L⁻¹ in phase 4, 256 and $3340 \pm 30 \text{ mg L}^{-1}$ in phase 5. 257 258 The daily specific biogas and methane yields were also determined. The specific biogas

- 259 yield (Figure 2B) decreased between phase 1 and 2 from 211 ± 12 to 163 ± 9 NmL gvs⁻¹
- 260 d^{-1} , then increased to 191 ± 9 NmL g_{VS}⁻¹ d^{-1} (phase 3), remaining almost stable during
- 261 phase 4, and finally jumped up to 286 ± 8 NmL g_{VS}⁻¹ d⁻¹ in phase 5. The specific
- 262 methane yield followed a specular trend with a decrease between phases 1 and 2 (from

263	140 \pm 7 to 113 \pm 7 NmL g _{VS} ⁻¹ d ⁻¹), followed by a slow rise (up to 145 \pm 7 NmL g _{VS} ⁻¹ d ⁻¹)
264	in phase 4 and a marked increase to $198 \pm 6 \text{ NmL } \text{gvs}^{-1} \text{ d}^{-1}$ in phase 5.
265	Similarly, specific biogas and methane yields expressed as NmL g $_{tCOD}^{-1}$ d ⁻¹ (Figure 2C)
266	confirmed the trends shown in Figure 2B, with minimum average values in phase 2 (92
267	\pm 5 and 64 \pm 4 NmL g $_{tCOD}^{1}$ d $^{-1}$ respectively), and maximum values (157 \pm 4 and 109 \pm
268	3 NmL g $_{tCOD}$ ⁻¹ d ⁻¹) in phase 5. The addition of BC from day 50 did not correspond to
269	any clear variation in specific biogas and methane yields between phases 3 and 4.
270	Considering the biogas composition (Figure 2D), the stability of CH_4 and CO_2 contents
271	over time was clear, in the range 67.1-69.0% and 28.6-30.8% during the CTRL phase,
272	and 68.9-69.1 % and 29.6-30.1 % during BC addition, respectively. In all phases, the
273	H ₂ S concentration in biogas was almost negligible (below 16 ppm). Methane content of
274	almost 70% confirmed a good stability of the AD process (Duan et al., 2012). However,
275	under the specific experimental conditions, BC did not positively affect methane
276	content, in contrast with literature. For instance, Shen et al. (2017) found an increase of
277	14-25% of the average methane content with the addition of BCs derived from corn
278	stover and pine, compared to a control reactor, during the temperature-phased semi-
279	continuous AD of sludge at 55 °C. Wei et al. (2020) showed that supplementation of
280	corn stover BC enhanced methane content up to 21% compared to control reactors
281	during the continuous AD of primary sludge at 55 °C.
282	Figure 2E shows the trend of the OLR, expressed asVS and tCOD (as commonly found
283	in literature), during the AD test. In general, OLR did not vary significantly over the
284	duration of the test, ranging between 0.9-1.4 g $_{VS}$ L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹ and 1.6-2.1 g tCOD L ⁻¹ d ⁻¹ ,
285	which are typical values adopted in full-scale mesophilic digesters in WWTPs
286	(Bolzonella et al., 2005). However, OLR did not seem to positively affect the specific

287 biogas and methane yields observed in this work. In phase 2, the highest OLR values $(1.4 \text{ g ys } \text{L}^{-1}\text{d}^{-1}, 2.1 \text{ g tCOD } \text{L}^{-1}\text{d}^{-1})$ corresponded to the minimum specific biogas and 288 methane yields, equal to 163 ± 9 and 113 ± 7 NmL $g_{VS}^{-1}d^{-1}$, respectively. More 289 290 importantly, the marked increase in specific biogas (+42%) and methane yields (+37%)291 between phases 4 and 5 did not match a pronounced variation of the OLR. 292 293 Table 3. Results of multiple linear regression to predict biogas and anaerobic digestate parameters based on OLR as sCOD (g sCOD $L^{-1} d^{-1}$) and BC concentration (g L^{-1}). The 294 295 linear model is expressed in the form $y = b_0 + b_1 x_1 + b_2 x_2$, where y is the estimated

296 parameter, x_1 is the OLR, x_2 is BC concentration.

297

In parallel to the usual notations applied to OLR (expressed as VS and tCOD), we

299 decided to investigate the influence of sCOD on the OLR and included it in the further

300 evaluation of our experimental results. The soluble COD represents the fraction of COD

301 immediately accessible by microorganisms for degradation. The ratio between sCOD

302 and tCOD is used to quantify the degree of solubilization of the sludge, usually

303 considered as performance indicator to investigate the efficiency of pre-treatments in

304 improving the methane yield (Nguyen et al., 2021). In this study, despite the stability of

305 TS content (around 3.1%), the MS presented a variable sCOD/tCOD, in the range 2.9 –

306 8.6% (Figure 2E).

307 Since the increment in the methane yields during the BC addition occurred concurrently

308 with a change in MS composition, a single linear regression was used to investigate the

309 relationships between the specific biogas and methane yields (NmL $kgvs^{-1}d^{-1}$) and the

310 key characteristics of the MS, namely the OLR (expressed as VS, tCOD and sCOD),

311 and the sCOD/tCOD (%). A significant linear relation was not identified between the specific biogas yield and the OLR expressed as $g_{VS} L^{-1} d^{-1} (F(1.63) = 3.48, p > 0.05)$ or 312 313 as g tCOD L⁻¹ d⁻¹ (F(1.63) = 2.56, p > 0.05). Conversely, a significant positive linear 314 relation was found between biogas yield and the OLR expressed as g sCOD L⁻¹ d⁻¹ 315 (F(1.63) = 102.38, p = 7.9 e-15) with an R² of 0.60, and between the biogas yield and the sCOD/tCOD (%) (F(1.63) = 93.87, p = 4.2 e-14) with an R² of 0.62. As for biogas, 316 317 significant linear relationships between the specific methane yield expressed as NmL $kgvs^{-1}d^{-1}$ and the OLR expressed as VS (F(1.37) = 3.56, p > 0.05) or as tCOD (F(1.37) = 318 319 2.47, p > 0.05) were not found. In contrast, a significant positive linear relationship was identified for methane yield and OLR expressed as sCOD with an R^2 of 0.67 (F(1.37) = 320 75.41, p = 1.9 e-10) and methane yield and sCOD/tCOD (%) with an R² of 0.68 321 322 (F(1.63) = 79.17, p = 1.0 e-10). Therefore, the marked increase of the specific biogas 323 and methane yields in phase 5 may be ascribable to the corresponding increase of 324 sCOD/tCOD (%) in the MS from 5.8 % of phase 4 to 8.6 % of phase 5 (Figure 2E). 325 Given the significant role of MS composition (specifically, sCOD content) on biogas 326 and methane productions, the relative effect of BC addition and MS features on biogas 327 production and composition was further investigated through a multiple linear 328 regression analysis. From the results of the simple linear regression analysis, OLR 329 expressed as sCOD was identified as the most appropriate parameter to describe the MS composition. Two independent variables, namely OLR expressed as g sCOD L⁻¹ d⁻¹ and 330 331 BC concentration $(g L^{-1})$ were chosen to predict biogas and methane yields, and biogas 332 composition. The linear model was expressed in the form $y = b_0 + b_1 x_1 + b_2 x_2$, where y 333 is the estimated parameter, x_1 is the OLR, x_2 is the BC concentration. Considering the 334 results of the multiple linear regression analysis (Table 3), in general, the linear

regressions for daily biogas and methane yields (NmL d⁻¹) were significant, with R² 335 336 equal to 0.69 and 0.73, respectively. While significant positive relationships $(b_1>0, b_1>0)$ 337 p₁<0.05) for biogas or methane yields and OLR were confirmed, there were significant 338 negative relationships ($b_2 < 0$, $p_2 < 0.05$) with BC concentration. Further, positive linear 339 regressions were found between the specific biogas and methane yields (NmL gVS⁻¹ d⁻ 340 ¹) and the OLR. However, there was insufficient evidence ($p_2 > 0.05$) to conclude that 341 specific biogas and methane yields were positively $(b_2>0)$ affected by BC 342 supplementation. As expected, the linear regressions of CH₄ and CO₂ contents based on 343 OLR expressed as sCOD and BC concentration did not show any relationship. 344 Conversely, other studies proved that BC supplementation can enhance methane 345 production from sludge during continuous AD, adopting different operating conditions 346 or BC dosage and characteristics, compared to this work. As mentioned earlier, Shen et 347 al. (2017) demonstrated the enhancement of methane production from two-stage AD of 348 mixed sludge at 55 °C with the addition of corn stover BC. In that study, the positive 349 effects of BC were attributed to CO₂ removal, mitigation of ammonia inhibition, 350 increased alkalinity, shifts of microbial community, and linked to peculiar BC features 351 as the large specific surface area and micro-porous structure, high hydrophobicity and 352 content of aromatics and alkali and alkaline earth metals. Also Wei et al. (2020), testing 353 a BC having similar characteristics than the one considered by Shen et al. (2017), found 354 that BC increased methane production during thermophilic AD of primary sludge; 355 enhanced buffering capacity, alleviated ammonia inhibition, and CO₂ sequestration 356 were suggested as main mechanisms. Compared to the BCs used in the two mentioned studies, SS550a presents comparable specific surface area (109.2 m² g⁻¹), micro-porous 357 structure (total pore volume $0.169 \text{ cm}^3 \text{ g}^{-1}$, 6.19 average pore diameter), and contents of 358

359 alkali and alkaline earth metals, but also a less alkaline pH, lower hydrophobicity, and 360 higher H/C and O/C ratios. However, the main difference in the BC, compared with the 361 two cited studies, may consist in the lower dosage of BC adopted in the present work, equal to 10 g L⁻¹ of BC (corresponding to 0.50 ± 0.03 g BC/g_{VS} added, and 0.32 ± 0.01 362 363 g BC/g_{TS}), being 3.5-7 times lower than those of the other studies, with an optimum of 364 1.75-3.5 g BC/g_{VS} (Shen et al., 2017) and 1.82 g BC/g_{TS} (Wei et al., 2020). Moreover, 365 the cited studies fed the same substrate during the whole duration of their AD tests, 366 therefore the influence of the variability of sludge composition on the performance of 367 the AD in the presence of BC, which was highlighted as a key issue by the results of 368 this work, was not specifically explored in the literature.

369

370 Figure 3. Characteristics of the digestate during the AD test: (A) total and soluble

371 COD; (B) Total Solids and Volatile Solids; (C) Removals of total COD and soluble

372 COD; (D) Removals of Total Solids and Volatile Solids; (E) pH and Electrical

373 Conductivity; (F) Total Alkalinity, Organic Acids, Ammonia Nitrogen.

374

375 *3.3. Digestate characterization*

376 The trends of the characteristics of the digestate (Figure 3A) show that tCOD grew

during phase 1, then stabilized during the subsequent phases at 30-32 g L^{-1} (Table 2).

378 The stabilization of tCOD from the start-up phase was slower than that of the biogas

and methane yields. The sCOD remained relatively stable, below 860 mg L^{-1} , with

average values ranged between 540 and 730 mg L^{-1} during the different phases of the

test (Figure 3A). The linear relationships between output tCOD or sCOD and BC

382 concentration and OLR (expressed as sCOD) were not significant (Table 3).

383	The TS concentration (Figure 3B) was relatively stable during CTRL phase, with
384	average values in the range 2.92-3.25%, and slowly increased from day 50. Conversely,
385	the VS concentration remained relatively stable at 1.64-1.91% during the whole test.
386	The VS/TS ratio decreased from 56.3-57.3 % in the CTRL phase to 52.8-53.2 % with
387	the BC addition (Table 2). The results of the multiple linear regression analysis showed
388	a significant positive relationship between BC concentration and TS content, along with
389	a significant negative relationship between BC and VS/TS (Table 3). Obviously, OLR
390	expressed as sCOD did not significantly influence the TS and VS/TS ratio.
391	Despite the variability of sCOD in the input, the AD system reached a stable
392	concentration in the output. Overall, the resulting removals of tCOD and sCOD over
393	time were consistent with the biogas and methane yields (Figure 3C). The trend of
394	tCOD removal decreased from the initial values of phase 1 in the CTRL phase to
395	minimum values in phase 4, followed by an increase from day 70 up to an average of 32
396	\pm 3 % (Table 2) in phase 5. The obtained tCOD removal values in phase 5 (Table 2) are
397	consistent with literature, where tCOD removals are in the range 34-55 % (Astals et al.,
398	2012; Choi et al., 2018; Hidaka et al., 2013). Consistently with the trend of specific
399	methane yield, sCOD removal (Figure 3C) showed a decline from a mean of 65 ± 8 %
400	of phase 1 to 35 \pm 4 % of phase 3, rising to 80 \pm 2 % in phase 5. As for biogas and
401	methane yields, the multiple linear regression analysis found significant positive
402	relationships (b1>0, p1<0.05) for the removals of tCOD or sCOD and OLR as sCOD,
403	due to the relative stability of the output concentrations and the variability of sCOD in
404	the feed. Conversely, there was no evidence of positive effects of the BC
405	supplementation on COD removal.

406	The removal of TS and of VS (Figure 3D) were in the range 3.8-10.4% and 9.6-22.1%
407	in the CTRL phase, respectively, and in the range 4.5-32.5 % and 3.9-31.3 % with BC
408	supplementation. The multiple linear regression analysis did not find significant linear
409	relationships between solids removals and predictor variables (Table 3). Consistently
410	with biogas and methane productions, BC was not found to enhance the removal of
411	organic matter during the mesophilic semi-continuous AD of mixed sludge. These
412	results differ from those of Wei et al. (2020) who found an increase of 14.9% of VS
413	removal in presence of BC, compared to the control reactor, during the continuous AD
414	of primary sludge.
415	The pH was stable during the whole AD tests around 6.9-7.2 (Figure 3E), in the optimal
416	range for methanogens (Xu et al., 2020) and indicating a good process stability. The
417	Electrical Conductivity (EC) of the digestate ranged between 4.1 and 5.7 mS cm ⁻¹ ,
418	showing the highest values in phase 5 (5.1 \pm 0.1 mS cm ⁻¹). However, there was no
419	evidence of a significant positive effect of the BC concentration on the EC of the
420	digestate (Table 3), despite the relevant contents of cations in the BC (Table 2).
421	Figure 3F shows the trends of total alkalinity (TA), organic acids and ammonia nitrogen
422	concentrations in the digestate. Organic acids are important intermediates in the AD
423	processes, converted to carbon dioxide and methane by syntrophic acetogens and
424	methanogens, can accumulate with potential inhibitory effects on methanogens. The
425	total alkalinity is an indicator of the buffering capacity of the system, e.g. of the ability
426	of neutralizing organic acids. This is the reason why the control of total alkalinity and
427	organic acids concentrations is crucial for the stability of any AD system. TA ranged
428	from 2700 to 2900 mg l^{-1} CaCO ₃ during CTRL phase, and from 3000 to 3300 mg l^{-1}
429	CaCO ₃ with BC addition. Multiple linear regression analysis found a significant

430 positive relationship between BC concentration and TA in the digestate ($b_2>0$, $p_2<0.05$), 431 possibly related to a BC contribution to the buffering capacity of the system. The TA 432 increase is related to the alkalinity of SS550a BC, due to the presence of high contents 433 of K, Ca, Mg, Al in the ashes, as reported by other studies (Shen et al., 2015; Wang et 434 al., 2017; Zhou et al., 2020). The organic acids in the digestate were relatively stable 435 below concentrations of concern, with average values ranging 117-233 mg l⁻¹ of acetic 436 acid. Despite the variability of sCOD in input, there was not a significant effect of OLR 437 expressed as sCOD on the concentration of organic acids in output (Table 3), 438 consistently with previous results related to sCOD in the digestate. Further, the ratio 439 between organic acids and TA was relatively stable between 0.03 and 0.09. A ratio 440 below 0.4 is generally recommended for stable AD operations (Ahmed et al., 2021; 441 Zhou et al., 2020). Ammonia nitrogen concentration in the digestate (Figure 3F) 442 remained relatively stable around 400-600 mg l⁻¹, below inhibitory concentrations for 443 the AD process (Jiang et al., 2019). There was no evidence of a significant relationship 444 between BC concentration and ammonia nitrogen in the digestate from the multiple 445 linear regression analysis. Instead, other studies found a reduction of ammonia nitrogen 446 in presence of BC (Shen et al., 2015; Zhang et al., 2019). Ammonia nitrogen, produced 447 during AD through ammonification, could further contribute to the buffering capacity of AD system. A significant positive relationship (F(1.20) = 30.70, p = 2e-5, $R^2 0.61$) 448 449 between Ammonia nitrogen and TA was found by the multiple linear regression of the 450 experimental data of this work.

451

452 *3.4. Preliminary economic analysis*

453	The key question is whether the economic benefits deriving from BC addition exceed its
454	cost. The main benefit is the extra (compared to AD without any supplement) methane
455	yield, resulting in higher incomes from the sale of electricity. However, extra costs
456	derive from the supplementation of BC. A simplified economic analysis (section 2.5)
457	estimated the maximum unit cost of BC that equals the profits from the enhanced
458	methane yield in different scenarios. In this study (semi-continuous AD of MS at 37
459	°C), an enhanced methane yield of 22 % due to a dose of 10 g L^{-1} could be cost-
460	effective with a unit cost of BC below 0.043 USD kg ⁻¹ . This value is borderline with
461	respect of a typical range cost for BC of 0.05 - 0.5 USD kg ⁻¹ (Chiappero et al., 2020;
462	Chiappero et al., under review). Other studies presented different results (see Appendix)
463	depending on OLR, enhancement of methane yield, and BC dose. For instance, values
464	ranging 0.017-0.022 USD kg ⁻¹ were found for the AD of MS, due to similar
465	enhancements of methane yield (+ 21-27 %) but larger doses of BC (18.75 g L^{-1}).
466	Conversely, the AD of PS resulted in a higher maximum unit cost of 0.184 USD kg ⁻¹ ,
467	due to the larger OLR and the lower dose of BC. Further, promising results were
468	obtained for other scenarios regarding the AD of food waste and co-digestion of sewage
469	sludge and orange peel with maximum BC unit costs of 0.329 and 0.524 USD kg ⁻¹ ,
470	respectively, where the authors found larger improvements of CH_4 yields (38 % and 61
471	%) by adding similar doses of BC (15 and 10 g L^{-1}). Overall, the optimization of BC
472	dosage may be a key step towards the economic feasibility of BC supplementation in
473	AD.
474	

4. Conclusions

4/6	This research proved that, under the considered experimental conditions, the sCOD of
477	the substrate was the driving factor for the performances of the AD of MS,
478	independently of BC addition. This happens particularly in the AD of MS (because of
479	the high variability of the quality of PS), compared to the digestion of WAS, whose
480	composition is less variable. The same BC, tested in batch AD of sludge from the same
481	WWTP, was able to improve of 17% the methane yields obtained from WAS
482	(Chiappero et al., 2021) and of 22% from MS (Chiappero et al. under review).
483	

. .

....

000

. .

484 Acknowledgements

485 This research was funded with internal resources. The authors declare no conflict of

486 interest. The authors would like to thank CORDAR Biella Servizi SpA for supplying

487 the substrate and inoculum employed in this research. Authors' contributions:

488 experimental activity, data elaboration, original draft writing: M. Chiappero;

489 conceptualization, methodology, supervision, original draft writing: S. Fiore;

490 manuscript review: all authors.

491

. . .

— •

492 **References**

493 Abbas, Y., Yun, S., Wang, Z., Zhang, Y., Zhang, X., Wang, K., 2021. Recent 1. 494 advances in bio-based carbon materials for anaerobic digestion: A review. Renew. 495 Sustain. Energy Rev. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2020.110378 496 Ahmed, M., Sartori, F., Merzari, F., Fiori, L., Elagroudy, S., Negm, M.S., 2. 497 Andreottola, G., 2021. Anaerobic degradation of digestate based hydrothermal 498 carbonization products in a continuous hybrid fixed bed anaerobic filter. Bioresour. 499 Technol. 330, 124971. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.BIORTECH.2021.124971 500 Alenzi, A., Hunter, C., Spencer, J., Roberts, J., Craft, J., Pahl, O., Escudero, A., 3. 501 2021. Pharmaceuticals effect and removal, at environmentally relevant

- 502 concentrations, from sewage sludge during anaerobic digestion. Bioresour. 503 Technol. 319, 124102. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.BIORTECH.2020.124102 504 APHA-AWWA-WEF, 2005. Standard methods for the examination of water and 4. 505 wastewater, 21st ed. Washington, DC, US. 506 Appels, L., Degrève, J., Van der Bruggen, B., Van Impe, J., Dewil, R., 2010. 5. 507 Influence of low temperature thermal pre-treatment on sludge solubilisation, heavy 508 metal release and anaerobic digestion. Bioresour. Technol. 101, 5743-5748. 509 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2010.02.068 510 Astals, S., Venegas, C., Peces, M., Jofre, J., Lucena, F., Mata-Alvarez, J., 2012. 6. 511 Balancing hygienization and anaerobic digestion of raw sewage sludge. Water Res. 512 46, 6218-6227. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.WATRES.2012.07.035 513 7. Bolzonella, D., Pavan, P., Battistoni, P., Cecchi, F., 2005. Mesophilic anaerobic 514 digestion of waste activated sludge: Influence of the solid retention time in the 515 wastewater treatment process. Process Biochem. 40, 1453–1460. 516 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procbio.2004.06.036 517 Chiappero, M., Berruti, F., Mašek, O., Fiore, S., 2021. Analysis of the influence of 8. 518 activated biochar properties on methane production from anaerobic digestion of 519 waste activated sludge. Biomass and Bioenergy 150, 106129. 520 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biombioe.2021.106129 521 9. Chiappero, M., Cillerai, F., Berruti, F., Mašek, O., Fiore, S., n.d. Addition of 522 different biochars as catalysts during the mesophilic anaerobic digestion of mixed 523 sludge. Catalysts (under review). 524 10. Chiappero, M., Norouzi, O., Hu, M., Demichelis, F., Berruti, F., Di Maria, F., 525 Mašek, O., Fiore, S., 2020. Review of biochar role as additive in anaerobic 526 digestion processes. Renew. Sustain. Energy Rev. 131. 527 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2020.110037 528 11. Choi, J.M., Han, S.K., Lee, C.Y., 2018. Enhancement of methane production in 529 anaerobic digestion of sewage sludge by thermal hydrolysis pretreatment. 530 Bioresour. Technol. 259, 207–213.
- 531 https://doi.org/10.1016/J.BIORTECH.2018.02.123
- 532 12. Duan, N., Dong, B., Wu, B., Dai, X., 2012. High-solid anaerobic digestion of
 533 sewage sludge under mesophilic conditions: Feasibility study. Bioresour. Technol.

- 534 104, 150–156. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2011.10.090
- 535 13. Elalami, D., Carrere, H., Monlau, F., Abdelouahdi, K., Oukarroum, A., Barakat, A.,
- 536 2019. Pretreatment and co-digestion of wastewater sludge for biogas production:
- 537 Recent research advances and trends. Renew. Sustain. Energy Rev. 114, 109287.
- 538 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2019.109287
- 539 14. Eurostat, 2021. Sewage sludge production and disposal [WWW Document]. URL
 540 https://appsso.eurostat.ec.europa.eu/nui/show.do?dataset=env_ww_spd&lang=en
- 541 (accessed 3.9.21).
- 542 15. Gherghel, A., Teodosiu, C., De Gisi, S., 2019. A review on wastewater sludge
 543 valorisation and its challenges in the context of circular economy. J. Clean. Prod.
 544 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.04.240
- 545 16. Gu, Y., Li, Y., Li, X., Luo, P., Wang, H., Wang, X., Wu, J., Li, F., 2017. Energy
- self-sufficient wastewater treatment plants: Feasibilities and challenges, in: Energy
 Procedia. Elsevier Ltd, pp. 3741–3751.
- 548 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.egypro.2017.03.868
- 549 17. Hidaka, T., Wang, F., Togari, T., Uchida, T., Suzuki, Y., 2013. Comparative
- 550 performance of mesophilic and thermophilic anaerobic digestion for high-solid
- 551 sewage sludge. Bioresour. Technol. 149, 177–183.
- 552 https://doi.org/10.1016/J.BIORTECH.2013.09.033
- 553 18. Jenicek, P., Kutil, J., Benes, O., Todt, V., Zabranska, J., Dohanyos, M., 2013.
- 554 Energy self-sufficient sewage wastewater treatment plants: Is optimized anaerobic
- sludge digestion the key? Water Sci. Technol. 68, 1739–1743.
- 556 https://doi.org/10.2166/wst.2013.423
- 557 19. Jiang, Y., McAdam, E., Zhang, Y., Heaven, S., Banks, C., Longhurst, P., 2019.
- 558 Ammonia inhibition and toxicity in anaerobic digestion: A critical review. J. Water
- 559 Process Eng. 32, 100899. https://doi.org/10.1016/J.JWPE.2019.100899
- 560 20. Kaur, G., Johnravindar, D., Wong, J.W.C., 2020. Enhanced volatile fatty acid
- 561 degradation and methane production efficiency by biochar addition in food waste-
- sludge co-digestion: A step towards increased organic loading efficiency in co-
- 563 digestion. Bioresour. Technol. 308, 123250.
- 564 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2020.123250
- 565 21. Khanh Nguyen, V., Kumar Chaudhary, D., Hari Dahal, R., Hoang Trinh, N., Kim,

- 566 J., Chang, S.W., Hong, Y., Duc La, D., Nguyen, X.C., Hao Ngo, H., Chung, W.J.,
- 567 Nguyen, D.D., 2021. Review on pretreatment techniques to improve anaerobic
 568 digestion of sewage sludge. Fuel 285, 119105.
- 569 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fuel.2020.119105
- 570 22. Li, S., Harris, S., Anandhi, A., Chen, G., 2019. Predicting biochar properties and
- 571 functions based on feedstock and pyrolysis temperature: A review and data

572 syntheses. J. Clean. Prod. 215, 890–902.

573 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.01.106

- 574
 23. Liang, J., Luo, L., Li, D., Varjani, S., Xu, Y., Wong, J.W.C., 2021. Promoting
- 575 anaerobic co-digestion of sewage sludge and food waste with different types of 576 conductive materials: Performance, stability, and underlying mechanism.

577 Bioresour. Technol. 337, 125384. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2021.125384

578 24. Lü, C., Shen, Y., Li, C., Zhu, N., Yuan, H., 2020. Redox-active biochar and

579 conductive graphite stimulate methanogenic metabolism in anaerobic digestion of
580 waste-activated sludge: Beyond direct interspecies electron transfer. ACS Sustain.

- 581 Chem. Eng. 8, 12626–12636. https://doi.org/10.1021/acssuschemeng.0c04109
- 582 25. Lu, J.S., Chang, J.S., Lee, D.J., 2020. Adding carbon-based materials on anaerobic
 583 digestion performance: A mini-review. Bioresour. Technol. 300, 122696.
 584 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2019.122696
- 585 26. Mašek, O., Buss, W., Roy-Poirier, A., Lowe, W., Peters, C., Brownsort, P.,
- 586 Mignard, D., Pritchard, C., Sohi, S., 2018. Consistency of biochar properties over
- 587 time and production scales: A characterisation of standard materials. J. Anal. Appl.

588 Pyrolysis 132, 200–210. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jaap.2018.02.020

589 27. Metcalf & Eddy, Tchobanoglous, G., Stensel, H.D., Tsuchihashi, R., Burton, F.,

590 2013. Wastewater Engineering: Treatment and Resource Recovery, 5th ed.
591 McGraw-Hill Education, New York, NY.

- 592 28. Mohammad Mirsoleimani Azizi, S., Hai, F.I., Lu, W., Al-Mamun, A., Ranjan Dhar,
- 593 B., 2021. A review of mechanisms underlying the impacts of (nano)microplastics
- on anaerobic digestion. Bioresour. Technol. 329, 124894.
- 595 https://doi.org/10.1016/J.BIORTECH.2021.124894
- 596 29. Panepinto, D., Fiore, S., Genon, G., Acri, M., 2016. Thermal valorization of sewer
- 597 sludge: Perspectives for large wastewater treatment plants. J. Clean. Prod. 137,

- 598 1323–1329. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2016.08.014
- 599 30. Qambrani, N.A., Rahman, M.M., Won, S., Shim, S., Ra, C., 2017. Biochar
- 600 properties and eco-friendly applications for climate change mitigation, waste
- 601 management, and wastewater treatment: A review. Renew. Sustain. Energy Rev.

```
602 79, 255–273. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2017.05.057
```

- 603 31. Shen, Y., Forrester, S., Koval, J., Urgun-Demirtas, M., 2017. Yearlong semi-
- 604 continuous operation of thermophilic two-stage anaerobic digesters amended with
- biochar for enhanced biomethane production. J. Clean. Prod. 167, 863–874.

606 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2017.05.135

- 607 32. Shen, Y., Linville, J.L., Ignacio-de Leon, P.A.A., Schoene, R.P., Urgun-Demirtas,
- M., 2016. Towards a sustainable paradigm of waste-to-energy process: Enhanced
 anaerobic digestion of sludge with woody biochar. J. Clean. Prod. 135, 1054–1064.
- 610 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2016.06.144
- 611 33. Shen, Y., Linville, J.L., Urgun-Demirtas, M., Schoene, R.P., Snyder, S.W., 2015.
- Producing pipeline-quality biomethane via anaerobic digestion of sludge amended
 with corn stover biochar with in-situ CO2 removal. Appl. Energy 158, 300–309.
 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apenergy.2015.08.016
- 615 34. Shen, Y., Yu, Y., Zhang, Y., Urgun-Demirtas, M., Yuan, H., Zhu, N., Dai, X.,
- 616 2021. Role of redox-active biochar with distinctive electrochemical properties to
- 617 promote methane production in anaerobic digestion of waste activated sludge. J.
- 618 Clean. Prod. 278, 123212. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2020.123212
- 619 35. Souza, C. de S., Bomfim, M.R., Almeida, M. da C. de, Alves, L. de S., Santana,
- 620 W.N. de, Amorim, I.C. da S., Santos, J.A.G., 2021. Induced changes of pyrolysis
- 621 temperature on the physicochemical traits of sewage sludge and on the potential
- 622 ecological risks. Sci. Reports 2021 111 11, 1–13. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-
- 623 020-79658-4
- 624 36. Wang, D., Ai, J., Shen, F., Yang, G., Zhang, Y., Deng, S., Zhang, J., Zeng, Y.,
- 625 Song, C., 2017. Improving anaerobic digestion of easy-acidification substrates by
- 626 promoting buffering capacity using biochar derived from vermicompost. Bioresour.
- 627 Technol. 227, 286–296. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2016.12.060
- 628 37. Wang, P., Peng, H., Adhikari, S., Higgins, B., Roy, P., Dai, W., Shi, X., 2020.
- 629 Enhancement of biogas production from wastewater sludge via anaerobic digestion

- 630 assisted with biochar amendment. Bioresour. Technol. 309.
- 631 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2020.123368
- 632 38. Wei, W., Guo, W., Ngo, H.H., Mannina, G., Wang, D., Chen, X., Liu, Y., Peng, L.,
- 633 Ni, B.-J., 2020. Enhanced high-quality biomethane production from anaerobic
- 634 digestion of primary sludge by corn stover biochar. Bioresour. Technol. 306.
- 635 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2020.123159
- 636 39. Wu, B., Yang, Q., Yao, F., Chen, S., He, L., Hou, K., Pi, Z., Yin, H., Fu, J., Wang,
- 637 D., Wang, D., Li, X., 2019. Evaluating the effect of biochar on mesophilic
- 638 anaerobic digestion of waste activated sludge and microbial diversity. Bioresour.
- 639 Technol. 294. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2019.122235
- 640 40. Xu, H., Li, Y., Hua, D., Zhao, Y., Mu, H., Chen, H., Chen, G., 2020. Enhancing the
- 641 anaerobic digestion of corn stover by chemical pretreatment with the black liquor
- from the paper industry. Bioresour. Technol. 306, 123090.
- 643 https://doi.org/10.1016/J.BIORTECH.2020.123090
- 644 41. Xu, S., Wang, C., Duan, Y., Wong, J.W.C., 2020. Impact of pyrochar and
- hydrochar derived from digestate on the co-digestion of sewage sludge and swinemanure. Bioresour. Technol. 314, 123730.
- 647 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2020.123730
- 648 42. Yin, C., Shen, Y., Yuan, R., Zhu, N., Yuan, H., Lou, Z., 2019. Sludge-based
- biochar-assisted thermophilic anaerobic digestion of waste-activated sludge in
- 650 microbial electrolysis cell for methane production. Bioresour. Technol. 284, 315–
- 651 324. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2019.03.146
- 43. Zhang, M., Li, J., Wang, Y., Yang, C., 2019. Impacts of different biochar types on
 the anaerobic digestion of sewage sludge. RSC Adv. 9, 42375–42386.
- 654 https://doi.org/10.1039/c9ra08700a
- 44. Zhang, M., Wang, Y., 2020. Effects of Fe-Mn-modified biochar addition on
- anaerobic digestion of sewage sludge: Biomethane production, heavy metal
- 657 speciation and performance stability. Bioresour. Technol. 313.
- 658 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2020.123695
- 45. Zhang, P., Zhang, X., Li, Y., Han, L., 2020. Influence of pyrolysis temperature on
- 660 chemical speciation, leaching ability, and environmental risk of heavy metals in
- biochar derived from cow manure. Bioresour. Technol. 302, 122850.

- 662 https://doi.org/10.1016/J.BIORTECH.2020.122850
- 46. Zhang, Z., Zhu, Z., Shen, B., Liu, L., 2019. Insights into biochar and hydrochar
 production and applications: A review. Energy.
- 665 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2019.01.035
- 666 47. Zhen, G., Lu, X., Kato, H., Zhao, Y., Li, Y.Y., 2017. Overview of pretreatment
- 667 strategies for enhancing sewage sludge disintegration and subsequent anaerobic
- digestion: Current advances, full-scale application and future perspectives. Renew.
- 669 Sustain. Energy Rev. 69, 559–577. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2016.11.187
- 670 48. Zhou, H., Brown, R.C., Wen, Z., 2020. Biochar as an additive in anaerobic
- 671 digestion of municipal sludge: Biochar properties and their effects on the digestion
- 672 performance. ACS Sustain. Chem. Eng. 8, 6391–6401.
- 673 https://doi.org/10.1021/acssuschemeng.0c00571
- 674

- **Figure 1.** Configuration of the 3 L stainless-steel reactor: (1) motor and mixer; (2) gas
- 677 outlet; (3) closing screws; (4) discharging port; (5) silicone stopper; (6) inflow; (7)
- 678 heater connection; (8) outflow.



Table 1. Chemical characteristics of the mixed sludge, mixed sludge with 10 g L^{-1} of

683 SS550a BC, and of the digestate. Data expressed as mean \pm standard error (number of

684 values).

	Mixed sludge	Mixed sludge +	Digestate
		SS550a (10 g l ⁻¹)	
pH [-]	6.1 ± 0.1 (4)	6.0 ± 0.3 (2)	7.33 ± 0.003 (1)
TS [%-wt]	3.1 ± 0.1 (4)	3.9 ± 0.1 (2)	2.51 ± 0.04 (1)
VS [%-wt]	2.0 ± 0.1 (4)	2.2 ± 0.2 (2)	1.36 ± 0.03 (1)
VS/TS [%-wt]	64 ± 2.0 (4)	55 ± 2.4 (2)	54.3 ± 0.1 (1)
tCOD [g L ⁻¹ O ₂]	35 ± 2 (4)	38 ± 6 (2)	21.0 ± 0.7 (1)
sCOD [g L ⁻¹ O ₂]	2.0 ± 0.5 (4)	2.6 ± 0.7 (2)	0.34 ± 0.04 (1)

Figure 2. Biogas, methane and carbon dioxide productions during the semi-continuous AD of mixed sludge with and without SS550a biochar: (A) Gas production as NmL d⁻¹; (B) Gas production as NmL g tCOD⁻¹ d⁻¹; (C) Gas production as NmL g VS⁻¹ d⁻¹; (D) CH₄, CO₂, and H₂S concentration; (E) Organic loading rate as gVS L⁻¹ d⁻¹ and g tCOD L⁻¹ d⁻¹



		CTRL			SS550a	
		Phase 1	Phase 2	Phase 3	Phase 4	Phase 5
Diagon		(day 10-20)	(day 21-31)	(day 32-49)	(day 50-73)	(day /4-101)
properties	Biogas [NmL d ⁻¹]	791 (45)	707 (37)	637 (28)	527 (18)	917 (26)
properties	Biogas [NmL $g_{VS}^{-1} d^{-1}$]	211 (12)	163 (9)	191 (9)	202 (7)	286 (8)
	Biogas [NmL g COD ⁻¹ d ⁻¹]	125 (7)	92 (5)	108 (5)	109 (4)	157 (4)
	Methane [NmL d ⁻¹]	525 (28)	491 (30)	445 (18)	379 (19)	636 (19)
	Methane [NmL gVS ⁻¹ d ⁻¹]	140 (7)	113 (7)	132 (6)	145 (7)	198 (6)
	Methane [NmL gCOD ⁻¹ d ⁻¹]	83 (4)	64 (4)	75 (3)	78 (4)	109 (3)
	CO ₂ [NmL d ⁻¹]	224 (12)	214 (12)	201 (8)	163 (8)	277 (9)
	CO ₂ [NmL gvs ⁻¹ d ⁻¹]	60 (3)	49 (3)	60 (3)	62 (3)	86 (3)
	CO ₂ [NmL g _{COD⁻¹} d ⁻¹]	35 (2)	28 (2)	34 (2)	34 (2)	47 (1)
	CH4 [% vv]	67.1 (2.3)	69.0 (0.3)	68.2 (0.2)	68.9 (0.2)	69.1 (0.1)
	CO ₂ [% vv]	28.6 (0.9)	30.1 (0.2)	30.8 (0.1)	29.6 (0.2)	30.1 (0.1)
	H ₂ S [ppm vv]	0.8 (0.3)	1.4 (0.2)	9.5 (1.4)	2.7 (0.6)	6.4 (0.9)
Digestate	TS [%]	2.9 (0.1)	3.2 (0.2)	3.3 (0.1)	3.5 (0.1)	3.6 (0.1)
properties	VS [%]	1.6 (0.04)	1.8 (0.1)	1.9 (0.1)	1.9 (0.02)	1.9 (0.1)
	VS/TS [%]	56.3 (0.1)	57.0 (0.8)	57.3 (0.2)	53.2 (1.0)	52.8 (0.5)
	pH [-]	7.2 (0.1)	7.1 (0.1)	6.9 (0.1)	7.1 (0.1)	7.1 (0.03)
	tCOD [g L^{-1}]	22 (4)	30 (3)	32 (1)	30.5 (0.4)	32 (1)
	sCOD [mg L ⁻¹]	541 (128)	637 (51)	730 (43)	645 (43)	675 (53)
	Ammonia Nitrogen [mg L ⁻¹]	505 (3)	442 (29)	463 (6)	505 (19)	534 (17)
	Organic Acids [mg L ⁻¹ CH ₃ COOH]	117 (13)	204 (23)	233 (16)	200 (15)	208 (21)
	Electrical conductivity [mS cm ⁻¹]	4.5 (0.1)	4.1 (0.1)	4.4 (0.2)	4.6 (0.1)	5.1 (0.1)
	Total Alkalinity [mg L ⁻¹ CaCO ₃]	2900 (25)	2764 (145)	2721 (51)	2997 (108)	3293 (47)
	TS removal [%]	5 (2)	9 (2)	5 (1)	12 (4)	16 (4)
	VS removal [%]	12 (2)	21 (1)	17 (1)	11 (3)	21 (3)
	tCOD removal [%]	29 (11)	28 (1)	20(1)	10 (6)	32 (3)
	sCOD removal [%]	65 (8)	43 (5)	35 (4)	67 (4)	80 (2)

Table 2. Summary of the experimental results of the semi-continuous AD test, in each phase, reported as mean (standard error).

Table 3. Results of multiple linear regression to predict biogas and anaerobic digestate parameters based on OLR as sCOD (g sCOD L⁻¹ d⁻¹) and biochar concentration (g L⁻¹). The linear model is expressed in the form $y = b_0 + b_1 x_1 + b_2 x_2$, where y is the estimated parameter, x_1 is the OLR, x_2 is the BC concentration.

	Dependent variable (y)	df	df	F	р	\mathbb{R}^2	bo	p 0	b1	p 1	b ₂	p ₂
	-	regression	residuals		-			-		-		-
Biogas	Biogas [NmL d ⁻¹]	2	61	68.96	2.2E-16	0.693	330.5	6.6E-13	4898.3	3.8E-17	-24.60	3.4E-09
properties	Biogas [NmL gvs ⁻¹ d ⁻¹]	2	61	50.94	9.8E-14	0.625	111.4	3.4E-13	999.6	1.1E-09	0.24	0.84
	Methane [NmL d ⁻¹]	2	36	48.52	6.0E-11	0.729	245.5	2.7E-10	3182.7	1.7E-11	-15.13	5.6E-06
	Methane [NmL gvs ⁻¹ d ⁻¹]	2	36	37.76	1.4E-09	0.677	83.0	3.0E-10	621.3	3.0E-06	0.81	0.41
	$CO_2 [NmL d^{-1}]$	2	36	42.47	3.4E-10	0.702	110.3	4.2E-10	1372.6	7.8E-11	-6.86	6.5E-06
	$CO_2 [NmL g_{VS}^{-1} d^{-1}]$	2	36	31.49	1.2E-08	0.636	37.0	6.3E-10	269.3	7.8E-06	0.24	0.59
	CH4 [% vv]	2	36	1.63	0.21	0.083	68.3	1.8E-45	-1.8	0.82	0.10	0.16
	CO ₂ [% vv]	2	36	0.41	0.67	0.022	30.3	6.3E-41	-2.3	0.64	-0.01	0.84
	H ₂ S [ppm vv]	2	36	0.12	0.89	0.006	4.4	0.03	9.3	0.68	-0.09	0.64
Digestate	TS [%]	2	20	10.53	7.5E-04	0.513	3.2	1.3E-15	-1.0	0.57	0.05	0.002
properties	VS [%]	2	20	1.62	0.22	0.140	1.8	2.1E-15	-0.5	0.60	0.01	0.13
	VS/TS [%]	2	20	38.54	1.4E-07	0.794	56.9	1.6E-26	0.4	0.96	-0.43	6.1E-06
	pH [-]	2	20	0.56	0.58	0.053	7.0	3.9E-26	1.0	0.35	-0.004	0.69
	tCOD [g L ⁻¹]	2	20	1.25	0.31	0.111	30.4	1.4E-10	-21.7	0.47	0.38	0.15
	sCOD [mg L ⁻¹]	2	20	0.06	0.94	0.006	678.7	7.4E-08	-333.2	0.73	2.19	0.79
	Ammonia Nitrogen [mg L ⁻¹]	2	20	6.80	0.01	0.405	438.3	7.2E-14	410.3	0.16	3.11	0.21
	Organic Acids [mg L ⁻¹ CH ₃ COOH]	2	19	0.50	0.61	0.050	218.8	2.1E-06	-350.2	0.37	3.04	0.37
	Electrical conductivity [mS cm ⁻¹]	2	20	18.35	3.0E-05	0.647	3.9	2.4E-16	5.0	0.02	0.03	0.08
	Total Alkalinity [mg L ⁻¹ CaCO ₃]	2	19	26.41	3.3E-06	0.735	2531.9	1.2E-16	3201.1	0.01	23.23	0.03
	TS removal [%]	2	18	1.39	0.28	0.133	4.7	0.37	42.1	0.47	0.28	0.58
	VS removal [%]	2	18	2.00	0.16	0.182	8.3	0.08	98.1	0.06	-0.51	0.25
	tCOD removal [%]	2	18	5.81	0.01	0.392	1.6	0.82	278.4	0.003	-1.59	0.04
	sCOD removal [%]	2	20	23.23	6.1E-06	0.699	30.8	1.3E-04	229.2	0.01	1.32	0.06

Figure 3. Characteristics of the digestate during the AD test: (A) total and soluble COD; (B) Total Solids and Volatile Solids; (C) Removals of total COD and soluble COD; (D) Removals of Total Solids and Volatile Solids; (E) pH and Electrical Conductivity; (F) Total Alkalinity, Organic Acids, Ammonia Nitrogen.

